# 1 Changes in apparent temperature and PM<sub>2.5</sub> around the

## 2 Beijing-Tianjin megalopolis under greenhouse gas and

## 3 stratospheric aerosol intervention scenarios

4 Jun Wang<sup>1</sup>, John C. Moore<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Liyun Zhao<sup>1\*</sup>

- 5 <sup>1</sup>College of Global Change and Earth Systems Science, Beijing Normal University,
- 6 Beijing 100875, China

<sup>7</sup><sup>2</sup>Arctic Center, University of Lapland, Rovaniemi, Finland

- 8 Correspondence to: zhaoliyun@bnu.edu.cn, john.moore.bnu@gmail.com
- 9
- 10

Abstract. Apparent temperatures (AP) and ground level aerosol pollution (PM<sub>2.5</sub>) are 11 important factors in human health, particularly in rapidly growing urban centres in the 12 developing world. We quantify how changes in apparent temperature - that is a 13 combination of 2 m air temperature, relative humidity and surface wind speed, and 14 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations – that depend on the same meteorological factors along with 15 future industrial emission policy, may impact people in the greater Beijing region. Four 16 Earth System Models (ESM) simulations of the modest greenhouse emissions RCP4.5, 17 the "business-as-usual" RCP8.5 and the stratospheric aerosol intervention G4 18 geoengineering scenarios are downscaled using both a 10 km resolution dynamic model 19 (WRF), and a statistically approach (ISIMIP). We use multiple linear regression models 20 21 to simulate changes in PM<sub>2.5</sub> and the contributions meteorological factors make in 22 controlling seasonal AP and PM2.5. WRF produces warmer winters and cooler summers than does ISIMIP both now and in the future. These differences mean that estimates of 23 numbers of days with extreme apparent temperatures vary systematically with 24 downscaling method, as well as between climate models and scenarios. Air temperature 25 changes dominate differences in apparent temperatures between future scenarios even 26 more than they do at present because the reductions in humidity expected under solar 27 28 geoengineering are overwhelmed by rising vapor pressure due to rising temperatures and the lower windspeeds expected in the region in all future scenarios. Compared with 29 the 2010s, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is projected to decrease 5.4  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in the Beijing-Tianjin 30 province under the G4 scenario during the 2060s from the WRF downscaling, but 31 decrease by 7.6  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> using ISIMIP. The relative risk of 5 diseases decreases by 1.1%-32 6.7% in G4/RCP4.5/RCP8.5 using ISIMIP, but have smaller decrease (0.7%-5.2%) 33 using WRF. Temperature and humidity differences between scenarios change the 34 35 relative risk of disease from PM<sub>2.5</sub> such that G4 results in 1-3% higher health risks than RCP4.5. Urban centres see larger rises in extreme apparent temperatures than rural 36 surroundings due to differences in land surface type, and since these are also the most 37 densely populated, health impacts will be dominated by the larger rises in apparent 38 temperatures in these urban areas. 39

#### 41 **500 character non-technical text**

Apparent temperatures and PM<sub>2.5</sub> pollution depends on humidity and wind speed in addition to surface temperature and impacts human health and comfort. Apparent temperatures will reach dangerous levels more commonly in future because of water vapor pressure rises and lower expected wind speeds, but these will also drive change in PM<sub>2.5</sub>. Solar geoengineering can reduce the frequency of extreme events significantly relative to modest, and especially "business as usual" greenhouse scenarios.

49

## 50 **1. Introduction**

Global mean surface temperature has increased by 0.92°C (0.68-1.17°C) during 1880-51 2012 (IPCC, 2021), which naturally also impacts the human living environment 52 (Kraaijenbrink et al., 2017; Garcia et al., 2018). However, neither land surface 53 temperature nor near-surface air temperature can adequately represent the temperature 54 we experience. Apparent temperature (AP), that is how the temperature feels, is 55 formulated to reflect human thermal comfort and is probably a more important 56 indication of health than daily maximum or minimum temperatures (Fischer et al., 2013; 57 Matthews et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2021). There are various approaches to estimating 58 how the weather conditions affect comfort, but apparent temperature is governed by air 59 60 temperature, humidity and wind speed (Steadman 1984; Steadman 1994). These are known empirically to affect human thermal comfort (Jacobs et al., 2013), and thresholds 61 have been designed to indicate danger and health risks under extreme heat events (Ho 62 et al., 2016). Analysis of historical apparent temperatures in China (Wu et al., 2017; Chi 63 et al., 2018; Wang et al., 2019), Australia (Jacobs et al., 2013), and the USA (Grundstein 64 et al., 2011) all find that apparent temperature is increasing faster than air temperature. 65 66 This is due to both decreasing wind speeds and, especially to increasing vapor pressure (Song et al., 2022). 67

68

As the world warms, apparent temperature is expected to rise faster than air 69 temperatures in the future (Li et al., 2018; Song et al., 2022). Hence, humans, and other 70 species, will face more heat-related stress but less cold-related environmental stress in 71 the warmer future (Wang et al., 2018; Zhu et al., 2019). Since most of the population is 72 now urban, the conditions in cities will determine how tolerable are future climates for 73 74 much of humanity, while the differences in thermal comfort between urbanized and rural regions will be a factor in driving urbanization. Reliable estimates of future urban 75 temperatures and their rural surroundings require methods to improve on standard 76 climate model resolution to adequately represent the different land surface types; 77 78 especially the rapid and accelerating changes in land cover in the huge urban areas 79 characteristic of sprawling developments in the developing world. This is usually done with either statistical or dynamic downscaling approaches, and in this article we 80 examine both methods. 81

83 In early 2013, Beijing encountered a serious pollution incident. The concentration of PM<sub>2.5</sub> (particles with diameters less than or equal to 2.5 µm in the atmosphere) exceeded 84  $500 \,\mu\text{g/m}^3$  (Wang et al., 2014). Following this event and its expected impacts on human 85 health (Guan et al., 2016; Fan et al., 2021) and the economy (Maji et al., 2018; Wang 86 et al., 2020), the Beijing municipal government launched the Clean Air Action Plan in 87 2013. The annual mean concentration of PM2.5 in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region 88 decreased from 90.6  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in 2013 to 56.3  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in 2017, a decrease of about 38% 89 (Zhang et al., 2019), although this is still more than double the EU air quality standard 90  $(25 \ \mu g/m^3)$  and above the Chinese FGNS (First Grand National Standard) of 35  $\mu g/m^3$ . 91 The concentration of PM<sub>2.5</sub> is related to anthropogenic emissions, but also dependent 92 93 on meteorological conditions (Chen et al., 2020). Simulations suggested that 80% of 94 the 2013-2017 lowering of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration came from emission reductions in Beijing (Chen et al. 2019). Humidity and temperature are the main meteorological 95 factors affecting PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration in Beijing in summer, while humidity and wind 96 speed are the main factors in winter (Chen et al., 2018). Simulations driven by different 97 RCP emission scenarios with fixed meteorology for the year 2010 suggest that PM<sub>2.5</sub> 98 99 concentration will meet FGNS under RCP2.6, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei after 2040 (Li et al., 2016). 100

101

The focus here is in the differences in apparent temperature and PM<sub>2.5</sub> that may arise 102 from solar geoengineering (that is reduction in incoming short-wave radiation to offset 103 longwave absorption by greenhouse gases) via stratospheric aerosol inervention (SAI), 104 and pure greenhouse gas climates. We use all four climate models that have provided 105 sufficient data from the G4 scenario described by the Geoengineering Model 106 Intercomparison Project (GeoMIP). G4 specifies sulfates as the aerosol, and greenhouse 107 gas emissions from the RCP4.5 scenario (Kravitz et al., 2011). The impacts of G4 on 108 surface temperature and precipitation have been discussed at regional scales (Yu et al., 109 2015) and both are lowered relative to RCP4.5. Some studies have focused on regional 110 impact of SAI on apparent or wet bulb temperatures: in Europe, (Jones et al., 2018); 111 East Asia (Kim et al., 2020); and the Maritime Continent (Kuswanto et al., 2021). But 112 none of these studies have considered apparent temperature at scales appropriate for 113 rapidly urbanizing regions such as on the North China Plain. The only study to date on 114 115 SAI impacts on PM<sub>2.5</sub> pollution was a coarse resolution ( $4^{\circ} \times 5^{\circ}$ ) global scale model with sophisticated chemistry (Eastham et al., 2018). They simulated aerosol rainout from the 116 stratosphere to ground level, leading to an eventual increase in ground level PM<sub>2.5</sub>. 117 Eastham et al. (2018) concluded that SAI changes in tropospheric and stratospheric 118 ozone dominated PM<sub>2.5</sub> impacts on global mortality. However, this study included only 119 a first-order estimate of temperature and precipitation change on PM2.5 concentration 120 under geoengineering, and also did not consider the situation in a highly polluted urban 121 environment such as included in our domain, and which is typical of much of the 122 developing world. 123

124

125 The greater Beijing megalopolis lies in complex terrain, surrounded by hills and

mountains on three sides, and a flat plain to the southeast coast (Fig. 1). Over the period 126 1971-2014, apparent temperature rose at a rate of 0.42°C/10 years over Beijing-Tianjin-127 Hebei region, with urbanization having an effect of 0.12°C/10 years (Luo and Lau, 128 2021). By the end of 2019, the permanent resident population in Beijing exceeded 21 129 million. Tianjin, 100 km from Beijing, is the fourth largest city in China with a 130 population of about 15 million, and Langfang (population 4 million) is about 50 km 131 from Beijing. Thus, the region contains a comparable urbanized population as the 132 northeast US megalopolis. Since its climate is characterized by hot and moist summer 133 monsoon conditions, the population is at an enhanced risk as urban heat island effects 134 lead to city temperatures warming faster than their rural counterparts. 135

136

There are large uncertainties in projecting PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration in the future due to both 137 climate and industrial policies. Statistical methods are much faster than atmospheric 138 chemistry models (Mishra et al., 2015), and different scenarios are easy to implement. 139 We use a Multiple Linear Regression (MLR) model to establish the links between PM<sub>2.5</sub> 140 concentration, meteorology and emissions (Upadhyay et al., 2018; Tong et al., 2018). 141 We project and compare the differences of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration under G4 and RCP4.5 142 143 scenarios, and between different PM2.5 emission scenarios. Accurate meteorological data are crucial in simulating future apparent temperatures and PM<sub>2.5</sub> because all ESM 144 suffer from bias, and this problem is especially egregious at small scales. A companion 145 paper (Wang et al., 2022) looked at differences between downscaling methods with the 146 same 4 Earth System Models (ESM), domain and scenarios as we use here. 147

148

In this paper, we use the downscaled data to explore the effect of SAI on apparent 149 temperature and PM<sub>2.5</sub> over the greater Beijing megalopolis. The paper is organized as 150 follows. The data and methods of calculating AP, AP thresholds, the PM<sub>2.5</sub> MLR model 151 and its validation are briefly described in Section 2. The results from present day 152 simulation and future projections on apparent temperature and PM<sub>2.5</sub> are given in 153 Section 3, along with their associated impact analyses. In Section 4 we discuss and 154 interpret the findings, and finally we conclude with a summary of the main implications 155 of the geoengineering impacts on these two important human health indices in Section 156 5. 157



Figure 1. a, The 10 km WRF domain (red box) nested inside a 30 km resolution WRF domain (large black sector). b, The inner domain topography and major conurbations (red dots), with the urban areas of Beijing and Tianjin enclosed in red curves. Panels c and d show the population density (persons per km<sup>2</sup>) of Beijing and Tianjin provinces (defined by black borders) in 2010 and the grid cells within the Beijing-Tianjin province (blue boxes) when downscaled by ISIMIP (c) and WRF (d).

158

## 2. Data and Methods

## 165 2.1 Scenarios, ESM, downscaling methods and bias correction

The scenarios, ESM, downscaling methods and bias correction methods we use here 166 are as described in detail by Wang et al., (2022), and we just summarize the method 167 briefly here. We use three different scenarios: RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 (Riahi et al., 2011) 168 and the GeoMIP G4 scenario which span a useful range of climate scenarios: RCP4.5 169 is similar (Vandyck et al., 2016) to the expected trajectory of emissions under the 2015 170 Paris Climate Accord agreed Nationally Determined Contributions (NDCs); RCP8.5 171 172 represents a formerly business-as-usual, no climate mitigation policies, large signal to noise ratio scenario; G4 represents a similar radiative forcing as produced by the 1991 173 Mount Pinatubo volcanic eruption repeating every 4 years. 174

175

Climate simulations are performed by 4 ESM: BNU-ESM (Ji et al., 2014), HadGEM2-ES (Collins et al., 2011), MIROC-ESM (Watanabe et al., 2011) and MIROC-ESM-CHEM (Watanabe et al., 2011). We compare dynamical and statistical downscaling methods to convert the ESM data to scales more suited to capturing differences between contrasting rural and urban environments. To validate the downscaled AP from model results, we use the daily temperature, humidity and wind speed during 2008-2017 from the gridded observational dataset CN05.1 with the resolution of  $0.25^{\circ} \times 0.25^{\circ}$  based on

the observational data from more than 2400 surface meteorological stations in China, 183 which are interpolated using the "anomaly approach" (Wu and Gao, 2013). This dataset 184 is widely used, and has good performance relative to other reanalysis datasets over 185 China (Zhou et al., 2016; Yang et al., 2019; Yang et al., 2023; Yang and Tang, 2023). 186 Dynamical downscaling for the 4 ESM datasets was done with WRFv.3.9.1 with a 187 parameter set used for urban China studies (Wang et al., 2012) in two nested domains 188 at 30 and 10 km resolution over 2 time slices (2008-2017 and 2060-2069). We corrected 189 the biases in WRF output using the quantile delta mapping method (QDM; Wilcke et 190 al., 2013) with ERA5 (Hersbach et al., 2018) to preserve the mean probability density 191 function of the output over the domain without degrading the WRF spatial pattern. All 192 WRF results presented are after ODM bias correction. Statistical downscaling was done 193 with the trend-preserving statistical bias-correction Inter-Sectoral Impact Model 194 195 Intercomparison Project (ISIMIP) method (Hempel et al., 2013) for the raw ESM output, producing output matching the mean ERA5 observational data in the reference 196 historical period with the same spatial resolution, while allowing the individual ESM 197 trends in each variable to be preserved. 198

199

## 200 2.2 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration and emission data

In China there were few  $PM_{2.5}$  monitoring stations before 2013 (Xue et al., 2021). However, aerosol optical depths produced by the Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS) have been used to build a daily  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration dataset (ChinaHighPM2.5) at 1 km resolution from 2000 to 2018 (Wei et al., 2020). We use monthly  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration data during 2008-2015 from ChinaHighPM2.5 to train the MLR model, and the data during 2016-2017 to validate it. Figure S1 shows annual  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration over Beijing areas during 2008 (a) and 2017 (b).

208

Recent gridded monthly  $PM_{2.5}$  emission data were derived from the Hemispheric Transport of Air Pollution (HTAP\_V3) with a resolution of  $0.1^{\circ} \times 0.1^{\circ}$  during 2008-2017, which is a widely used anthropogenic emission dataset (Janssens-Maenhout et al., 2015).  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions over Beijing areas during 2008 (c) and 2017 (d) are shown in Fig. S1.

214

215 Future gridded monthly PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions to 2050 are available in the ECLIPSE V6b database (Stohl et al., 2015), generated by the GAINS (Greenhouse gas Air pollution 216 Interactions and Synergies) model (Klimont et al., 2017). The ECLIPSE V6b baseline 217 emission scenario assumes that future anthropogenic emissions are consistent with 218 those under current environmental policies, hence it is the "worst" scenario without 219 considering any mitigation measures (Li et al., 2018; Nguyen et al., 2020). Projected 220 emissions are shown in Fig S2, with emissions plateauing at ~40 kt/year after 2030, so 221 we assume 2060s levels are similar. These ECLIPSE projections are significantly larger 222 than present day estimates from HTAP V3. We therefore estimate 2060s emissions as 223 the recent gridded monthly PM2.5 emissions from HTAP V3 scaled by the ratios of 224 2050 ECLIPSE emission to average annual emissions between 2010 and 2015. Before 225

226 processing data, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is bilinearly interpolated to the WRF and ISIMIP

227 grids, while PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions are conservatively interpolated to the target grids.

228

235

239

## 229 **2.3 Apparent temperature**

We used a widely used empirical formula to calculate the apparent temperature under shade (Steadman 1984), that combines various meteorological fields, which also has been widely used to study heat waves, heat stress and temperature-related mortality (Perkins and Alexander, 2013; Lyon and Barnston, 2017; Lee and Sheridan, 2018; Zhu et al., 2021):

$$AP = -2.7 + 1.04 \times T + 2 \times P - 0.65 \times W \tag{1}$$

where AP is the apparent temperature (°C) under shade meaning that radiation is not considered; *T* is the 2 m temperature (°C), *W* is the wind speed at 10 m above the ground (m/s), and *P* is the vapor pressure (kPa) calculated by

$$P = P_s \times RH \tag{2}$$

240 where  $P_s$  is the saturation vapor pressure (kPa), and *RH* is the relative humidity (%). 241  $P_s$  is calculated using the Tetens empirical formula (Murray, 1966):

242 
$$P_{s} = \begin{cases} 0.61078 \times e^{\left(\frac{17.2693882 \times T}{T+237.3}\right), & T \ge 0} \\ 0.61078 \times e^{\left(\frac{21.8745584 \times (T-3)}{T+265.5}\right), & T < 0} \end{cases}$$
(3)

To assess the potential risks of heat-related exposure from apparent temperature, we 243 also count the number of days with  $AP > 32^{\circ}C$  (NdAP 32) in the Beijing-Tianjin 244 province (Table S1). This threshold does not lead to extreme risk and death, instead it 245 is classified as requiring "extreme caution" by the US National Weather Service 246 (National Weather Service Weather Forecast Office. 247 https://www.weather.gov/ama/heatindex), but carries risks of heatstroke, cramps and 248 exhaustion. A threshold of 39°C is classed as "dangerous" and risks heatstroke. While 249 hotter AP thresholds would give a more direct estimate of health risks, the statistics of 250 251 these presently rare events mean that detecting differences between scenarios is less reliable than using the cooler NdAP\_32 threshold simply because the likelihood of rare 252 events are more difficult to accurately quantify than more common events that are 253 sampled more frequently. There is evidence that in some distributions, the likelihood 254 255 of extremes will increase more rapidly than central parts of a probability distribution, 256 for example large Atlantic hurricanes increasing faster than smaller ones (Grinsted et al., 2013). But the conservative assumption is that similar differences between scenarios 257 would apply for higher thresholds as lower ones. 258

### 259 **2.4 Population Data Set**

Since health impacts scale with the number of people affected, we calculate the NdAP\_32 weighted by population (Fig. 1c and 1d). We employ gridded population data (Fu et al., 2014; https://doi.org/10.3974/geodb.2014.01.06.V1) with a spatial resolution of  $1 \times 1$  km collected in 2010. The population density distribution in Beijing and Tianjin provinces with the ISIMIP and WRF grid cells contained are shown in the Fig. 1c and 1d.

#### 267 **2.5 MLR model calibration**

Many meteorological factors, such as temperature (You et al., 2017), precipitation (Guo 268 et al., 2016), wind speed (Yin et al., 2017), radiation (Chen et al., 2017), planetary 269 boundary layer height (Zheng et al., 2017) etc., can affect the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration. Their 270 relative importance differs regionally. But here we consider only differences that are 271 produced by the three scenarios, so for example we do not include precipitation in our 272 analysis because none of the ESM simulate significant changes in our domain (Table 273 S2). Previous studies have shown that wind and humidity are the dominant 274 meteorological variables for PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration in region we study (Chen et al., 2020), 275 while changes in temperature and winds obviously impact local concentrations. Hence, 276 277 we generate an MLR model between PM<sub>2.5</sub> and temperature (T), relative humidity (H), zonal wind (U), meridional wind (V) and PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions (E) at every grid cell as 278 follows: 279

$$PM2.5 = \sum a_i X_i + b$$

Where  $X_{i(i=1,2,3,4,5)}$  are the five factors,  $a_i$  are the regression coefficients of the  $X_i$ 282 with  $PM_{2.5}$ , and b is the intercept, which is a constant. We assume that all factors 283 should be included in the regression. All the meteorological variables are from the 284 statistical and dynamical downscaling and bias corrected results during 2008-2017, 285 with the first 8 years used for training model and the second 2 years used for validating 286 model. We train the MLR for the 4 ESMs under statistical and dynamical downscaling 287 in each grid cell separately, thus accounting spatial differences in the weighting of the 288  $X_i$  across the domain. Meteorological variables under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 during 289 290 2060-2069 are used for projection.

(4)

291

Here, we use  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration including both primary and secondary  $PM_{2.5}$  as the dependent variable and primary  $PM_{2.5}$  emission and meteorological factors as independent variables in the MLR. Future  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions will change in ways that are rather speculative as they depend on technological innovation and policies that are inherently unpredictable. The MLR assumes that the past emissions mix and secondary aerosols remain unchanged in the future, but meteorological factors will also indirectly impact secondary  $PM_{2.5}$  to some extent.

299

The contributions of meteorology and  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions on future concentrations are examined by using recent  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions (baseline) and future  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions (mitigation), and the downscaled climate scenarios. Modeled  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration using recent meteorology and  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions during 2008-2017 (2010s) is considered as our reference.

305

306 Collinearity of variables is inevitable in our domain. The domination of the seasonal 307 winter and summer monsoonal weather patterns mean that temperatures, precipitation and wind direction are all highly seasonal and correlated. In winter, precipitation is
 minimal and northerly winds predominate, in summer the opposite is true. These three
 meteorological fields are important and also important for emissions, since sources are
 essentially absent from the north, while temperature and humidity dominate aerosol
 microphysics.

313

We use the variance inflation factor (VIF) to test if there is excessive collinearity in our 314 315 MLR models. Generally, if VIF value is greater than 10, there is collinearity problem between variables. Figure S3 shows that there are indeed collinearity problems in some 316 areas, but not in Beijing-Tianjin province, so there is no impact on the results for the 317 urban areas. We explored the impact of collinearity on the results in high VIF grid cells 318 319 by removing factors with VIF greater than 10 and the full variables model (Fig. S4 and 320 Fig. S5). Using ISIMIP downscaling, we only removed the temperature, while we removed the temperature and U-wind in the WRF method. PM2.5 concentrations 321 increased by  $\sim 1 \,\mu g/m^2$  in all ESMs under G4 with the "baseline" scenario (Fig. S4), in 322 contrast,  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations decreased by 5-15 µg/m<sup>2</sup> with the "mitigation" scenario 323 (Fig. S5) after dealing the collinearity problem. This means that PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration 324 has more sensitivity to the PM<sub>2.5</sub> emission after accounting for collinearity. Although 325 the absolute PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations are different accounting for collinearity, there are no 326 significant differences in the changes of PM2.5 concentration between G4 and the 327 2010s/RCP4.5/RCP8.5 in Beijing-Tianjin province. 328

### 329 **2.6 MLR model validation**



Figure 2. Scattergrams of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration derived by MODIS and estimated by MLR during validation period (2016-2017). Top figures (a-d) are the ISIMIP statistical downscaling results, and bottom figures (e-h) are the WRF dynamical downscaling results. R<sup>2</sup> means the variance explained

by the MLR, and color bar denotes the density of datapoints at integer intervals.

335

Figure 2 shows the scattergram of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration between ChinaHighPM2.5 336 dataset and MLR model during validation period based on ISIMIP and WRF results. 337 Observations and MLR models have Pearson's correlations coefficients around 0.86 for 338 ISIMIP results during the validation period, and the coefficient of determination of 339 MLRs are 0.74-0.75 (Fig. 2a-d). WRF Pearson's correlations are slightly lower, 0.82-340 0.85, and explained variance ranges from 0.68-0.72 (Fig. 2e-h). These results are 341 similar as found by Jin et al. (2022). We also compare the spatial patterns of observed 342 and modeled PM2.5 in Fig. S6. Both ISIMIP and WRF results can simulate the 343 distribution characteristics of high concentration of PM2.5 in the southeast and low 344 345 concentration in the northwest.

346

We also tested the accuracy of our MLR model projection against simulations (Li et al., 347 2023) with the Community Multiscale Air Quality (CMAQ) model developed by the 348 United States Environmental Protection Agency and which can simulate particulate 349 350 matter on local scales (Foley et al., 2010; Yang et al., 2019) when coupled to WRF. We used the same meteorological forcing as Li with the "EIT1" PM2.5 emissions scenario 351 in 2050 under RCP4.5 (Fig.S7). The spatial patterns are well correlated in all seasons 352 (0.68-0.73), but PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations are about twice as high in our MLR model as 353 from Li et al., (2023). PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations from our regression model are also higher 354 than the referenced data during 2008-2017. While the difference in absolute PM2.5 355 concentrations are significant, we mainly consider differences of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration 356 between G4 and RCP4.5/RCP8.5 in our study which we cannot compare these 357 anomalies with the single RCP4.5 scenario simulated by Li et al. (2023). We do 358 compare the spatial pattern of differences in PM2.5 concentration between "base" and 359 "EIT1" under RCP4.5. Because of the small slope coefficient of PM2.5 emission in our 360 MLR, we do not capture the large reduction of PM2.5 concentration in the Beijing city 361 362 center seen by Li et al. (2023), (Fig. S8).

363

## **2.7 Relative risks of mortality related to PM<sub>2.5</sub>**

We estimate the effects of PM<sub>2.5</sub> on mortality by considering changes in the relative risk 365 366 (RR) of mortality related to PM<sub>2.5</sub>. We lack data on mortality rates in the study domain without which we cannot estimate numbers of fatalities, just the average population-367 weighted RR. Burnett et al. (2014) established the integrated exposure-response 368 functions we use. The RR is non-linear in concentration, that is an initially low PM<sub>2.5</sub> 369 region will suffer higher mortality and RR than an initially high PM<sub>2.5</sub> region if PM<sub>2.5</sub> 370 is increased by the same amount. Ran et al. (2023) provide RR values for PM<sub>2.5</sub> 371 concentrations up to 200  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> that includes the 5 main major disease endpoints 372 (Global Burden of Disease Collaborative Network, 2013) of PM<sub>2.5</sub> related mortality: 373 374 chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, ischemic heart disease, lung cancer, lung 375 respiratory infection and stroke. We calculate the average population-weighted relative risks based on the gridded population dataset (Section 2.4) and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration in 376

the Beijing-Tianjin province defined in the Fig. 1c-1d, following Ran et al. (2023):

378

 $RR_{pop,k} = \frac{\sum_{g=1}^{G} POP_g \times RR_k(C_g)}{\sum_{g=1}^{G} POP_g} \quad (5)$ 

379  $RR_{pop,k}$  is the average population-weighted relative risk of disease k (k=1-5),  $POP_g$  is 380 the population of gird g, and  $RR_k(C_g)$  is the relative risk of disease k when PM<sub>2.5</sub> 381 concentration is  $C_g$  in the grid of g.

382

## **2.8 Determination of contributions to change in AP and PM<sub>2.5</sub>**

Equation (1) describes how AP is calculated, and this can be broken down into how 384 385 much equivalent temperature is produced by each term (Fig. 3), with 2008-2017 as the baseline interval for season-by-season contributors to AP. Across scenario seasonal 386 differences in contributors are then calculated as follows. We use an MLR approach, 387 since this minimizes the square differences from the mean across the dataset, with the 388 attendant assumption of independence between the data. Alternatives may also be 389 considered that e.g. minimize the impact of outliers by considering the magnitude of 390 the differences, but we prefer to keep the attractive properties of a least squares 391 approach. The dependent variable in the MLR is the change in AP ( $\Delta AP$ ) and the 392 independent variables are changes in each factor for each future scenario, 393

$$\Delta AP = \sum \alpha_i X_i + \beta \tag{6}$$

where  $X_{i(i=1,2,3)}$  are the daily changes of the three meteorological factors between two scenarios: 2 m temperature ( $\Delta T$ ), 2 m relative humidity ( $\Delta RH$ ) and 10 m wind speed ( $\Delta W$ ),  $\alpha_i$  are the regression coefficients of the  $X_i$  with  $\Delta AP$ , and  $\beta$  is the intercept, which is a constant. We assume that all three meteorological factors should be included in the regression and we estimate the contributions of each factor to changes of AP as:

400 
$$K_i = \frac{\alpha_i X_i}{\sum \alpha_i \overline{X_i}}$$
(7)

401 where  $K_{i(i=1,2,3)}$  is the contributions (in units of temperature) from each factor to the 402 changes of the AP, and  $\overline{X}_i$  are the mean differences in temperature equivalent due to 403 each factor between two scenarios.

404

405 The contribution of changes in each factor in changes of  $PM_{2.5}$  is simpler since we 406 assume that the relationship between each factor and  $PM_{2.5}$  is linear, and so its 407 contribution is the ratio of product of the regression coefficient and the change of each 408 factor to the change of  $PM_{2.5}$ .

409

## 410 **3. Results**

#### 411 **3.1 Recent apparent temperatures**



Figure 3. Seasonal averaged AP and equivalent temperature of each term in equation 1 for Beijing-Tianjin province (a-c) and Beijing-Tianjin urban areas (d-f) during 2008-2017 from CN05.1 (a, d), 4model ensemble mean after ISIMIP (b, e) and ensemble mean after WRF (c, f). Term 1 is 1.04T, term 2 is 2P and term 3 is -0.65W.

412

Figure 3 shows the seasonal averaged AP and equivalent temperatures caused by 418 temperature, relative humidity and wind speed in Beijing-Tianjin province and Beijing-419 Tianjin urban areas during 2008-2017. According to the CN05.1 results (Fig. 3a, 3d), 420 AP and the separate 3 terms show similar seasonal patterns over the whole province 421 and just the urban areas. Vapor pressure is higher in summer and wind speed is higher 422 in spring. AP is lower than 2 m temperature in all seasons except summer, and especially 423 lower in winter. AP, temperature, vapor pressure and wind speed are all higher in urban 424 areas than in the surrounding rural region in any season. The ISIMIP results (Fig. 3b, 425 3e), by design, perfectly reproduce the CN05.1 seasonal characteristics of AP, 426 temperature, vapor pressure and wind speed. WRF shows a similar pattern with that 427 from CN05.1, but for the Beijing-Tianjin province, WRF overestimates both 2 m 428 temperature and AP in winter by 2.1°C and by 1.7°C respectively relative to CN05.1 429 (Fig. 3c). In the Beijing-Tianjin urban areas, WRF overestimates the temperature and 430 AP relative to CN05.1 in all seasons, especially in winter (Fig. 3f). 431



Figure 4. Top row: the spatial distribution of mean apparent temperature from CN05.1 (a), raw ESMs ensemble mean after bilinear interpolation (b), 4-model ensemble mean after ISIMIP (c) and ensemble mean after WRF (d) during 2008-2017. Bottom row: the spatial distribution of annual mean number of days with AP >  $32^{\circ}$ C from CN05.1 (e), ESMs (f), ISIMIP (e) and WRF (f) during 2008-2017. Fig. S9 and Fig. S10 show the pattern of AP and NdAP 32 for the individual ESM.

We compare the simulations of mean apparent temperature and NdAP 32 from both 439 WRF dynamical downscaling with ODM and from ISIMIP statistical downscaling 440 during 2008-2017 in Fig. 4. Both WRF with QDM and ISIMIP methods produce a 441 pattern of apparent temperature which is close to that from CN05.1. While the raw AP 442 from ESMs is overestimated in Zhangjiakou high mountains and underestimated in the 443 southern plain, and shares a similar pattern with temperature from ESMs (Wang et al., 444 2022). The raw ESM outputs were improved after dynamical and statistical 445 downscaling. The average annual AP from ISIMIP (9.6-9.7°C) is 0.5°C higher than that 446 from CN05.1 (9.1°C) over the Beijing-Tianjin province for all ESMs (Table 1). While 447 WRF produces warmer apparent temperatures in the city centers of Beijing and Tianjin 448 449 and lower ones in the high Zhangjiakou mountains than recorded in the lower resolution CN05.1 observations. There are also differences between different models after WRF 450 downscaling. For example, apparent temperatures from the two MIROC models 451 downscaled by WRF are the warmest. In contrast AP from all 4 ESMs after ISIMIP 452 shows very similar patterns (Fig. S9). 453

454

433

ESMs tend to overestimate the number of days with AP>32°C in southeastern Beijing and the whole Tianjin province. Both ISIMIP and WRF appear to overestimate the NdAP\_32 in Beijing urban areas and the southerly lowland areas although NdAP\_32 is close to zero in the colder rural areas at relatively high altitude for both downscaling methods. Some of these differences may be due to the WRF simulations being at finer resolution than the  $0.25^{\circ} \times 0.25^{\circ}$  CN05.1, leading to higher probabilities of high AP in urban areas (Fig. 5d). ISIMIP results also show slight overestimations, especially in the tails of the distribution (AP>30°C) for urban areas (Fig. 5c). CN05.1 gives about 5
NdAP\_32 per year in southern Beijing and Tianjin, but there are nearly 15 NdAP\_32
from ISIMIP, and over 20 NdAP\_32 per year from WRF downscaling in the BeijingTianjin urban areas during 2008-2017. NdAP\_32 from WRF and ISIMIP downscaling
of all ESM is overestimated relative to CN05.1. But there are differences in ESM under
the two downscalings: with ISIMIP, HadGEM2-ES and BNU-ESM have more
NdAP\_32 than the two MIROC models, while the reverse occurs with WRF (Fig. S10).

469

470 Table 1. The annual mean apparent temperature and population weighted NdAP\_32 in Beijing-Tianjin
471 province and Beijing-Tianjin urban areas (Fig. 1b) from CN05.1, ISIMIP and WRF during 2008-2017.

Data Sources	AP (°C)				NdAP_32 (day yr <sup>-1</sup> )			
	Provinces		Urban		Population weighted for province (Fig. 1c, 1d)			
	WRF	ISIMIP	WRF	ISIMIP	WRF	ISIMIP		
MIROC-ESM	10.5	9.6	13.6	11.4	22.2	10.1		
MIROC-ESM-CHEM	10.5	9.6	13.6	11.4	21.9	11.0		
HadGEM2-ES	9.5	9.6	12.0	11.4	12.3	11.1		
BNU-ESM	9.4	9.7	11.8	11.5	10.2	12.7		
CN05.1	9.1		11.1		2.4			

472 The Taylor diagram of the daily mean apparent temperature in Beijing-Tianjin province and Beijing-Tianjin urban areas from 2008-2017 for the 4 ESMs shows that correlation 473 coefficients between ESMs and CN05.1 are greater than 0.85 under both downscaling 474 methods. Although there are differences between ESMs, the performance of WRF, with 475 476 higher correlation coefficient and smaller SD (standard deviation) and RMSD (root 477 mean standard deviation), is usually superior to ISIMIP (Fig. S11). Taking the Beijing-Tianjin urban areas as an example (Fig. S11b), under the ISIMIP method, MIROC-478 ESM, MIROC-ESM-CHEM and HadGEM2-ES have the same correlation coefficient 479 (0.92) and RMSD ( $5.4^{\circ}$ C) with the CN05.1, while BNU-ESM has lower correlation 480 coefficient (0.88) and higher RMSD (7.0°C). Under WRF simulations, MIROC-ESM 481 and MIROC-ESM-CHEM have larger correlation coefficients and smaller RMSD with 482 CN05.1 than HadGEM2-ES and BNU-ESM. 483

484 Figure 5 shows the probability density functions (pdf) of daily AP from the four ESMs under ISIMIP and WRF in Beijing-Tianjin province and Beijing-Tianjin urban areas 485 during 2008-2017. ISIMIP overestimates the probability of extreme cold AP relative to 486 CN05.1 (especially BNU-ESM), although all ESM reproduce the CN05.1 pdf well at 487 high AP. WRF can reproduce the CN05.1 distribution of AP better than ISIMIP, but 488 high AP is overestimated relative to CN05.1 and the urban areas perform less well than 489 the whole Beijing-Tianjin province. In urban areas all ESMs driving WRF tend to 490 491 underestimate the probability of lower AP and to overestimate the probability of higher AP, especially the two MIROC models (Fig. 5d). Fig. S12 displays the annual cycle of 492 monthly AP, with ISIMIP proving excellent by design, at reproducing the monthly AP. 493 While under WRF downscaling AP shows more across model differences, especially 494 during summer and with greater spread for the urban areas. 495



497 Figure 5. The probability density function (pdf) for daily apparent temperature under ISIMIP (a, c) and
498 WRF (b, d) results in Beijing-Tianjin province (a, b) and Beijing-Tianjin urban areas (c, d) during 2008499 2017.

## 500 3.2 2060s apparent temperatures

## **3.2.1 Changes of apparent temperature**



**Figure 6.** Spatial pattern of ensemble mean apparent temperature difference (°C) under different scenarios over 2060-2069: G4-2010s (left column), G4-RCP4.5 (middle column) and G4-RCP8.5 (right column) based on ISIMIP and WRF methods. 2010s refers to the 2008-2017 period. Stippling indicates grid points where differences or changes are not significant at the 5% level according to the Wilcoxon signed rank test.

508

Figure 6 shows the ISIMIP and WRF ensemble mean changes in the annual mean AP 509 under G4 during 2060-2069 relative to the past and the two future RCP scenarios. 510 ISIMIP-downscaled AP (Fig. 6a-6c) shows significant anomalies (p<0.05), with whole 511 domain rises of 2.0 °C in G4-2010s, and falls of 1.0 °C and 2.8 °C in G4-RCP4.5 and 512 G4-RCP8.5 respectively. In WRF results, AP under G4 is about 1-2 °C warmer than 513 that under 2010s, 0.8 °C and 2.5 °C colder than that under RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 over 514 the whole domain. Individual ESM results downscaled by ISIMIP and WRF are in Fig. 515 S14 and Fig. S15. For both ISIMIP and WRF downscaling results, the two MIROC 516 models show stronger warming than the other two models between G4 and the 2010s. 517 WRF-downscaled AP driven by HadGEM2-ES exhibits the strongest cooling, with 518 519 decreases of 1.7 °C between G4 and RCP4.5 and falls of 3.0 °C between G4 and RCP8.5. 520 Although different ESMs show different changes in AP between G4 and other scenarios, changes in AP are almost the same everywhere for a given ESM in the ISIMIP results 521 (Fig. S14). WRF-downscaled AP anomalies driven by two MIROC models are larger 522 in the Zhangjiakou mountains and smaller in the Beijing urban areas and Tianjin city 523 between G4 and 2010s (Fig. S15). Changes in AP from ISIMIP results, whether across 524 whole province or just the urban areas, are statistically identical given scenarios (Table 525 2), which is consistent with patterns in figure 6. AP under G4 is 0.8 °C (1.0 °C) and 526 2.6 °C (2.8 °C) colder than that under RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 in Beijing-Tianjin urban 527 areas from ISIMIP (WRF) results. The warming between G4 and 2010s in urban areas 528 is 1.0 °C in WRF results, while that is 2.0 °C in ISIMIP results (Table 2). 529

530

Table 2. Difference of apparent temperature between the G4 and other scenarios for the Beijing-Tianjin
 province and Beijing-Tianjin urban areas as defined in Fig. 1b during 2060-2069. Bold indicates the
 differences or changes are significant at the 5% level according to the Wilcoxon signed rank test.
 (Units: °C)

Model	G4-2010s			G4-RCP4.5				G4-RCP8.5				
	WRF		ISIMIP		WRF		ISIMIP		WRF		ISIMIP	
	Urban	Province	Urban	Province	Urban	Province	Urban	Province	Urban	Province	Urban	Province
MIROC-ESM	0.9	1.5	2.2	2.2	-0.5	-0.4	-0.9	-0.9	-2.3	-2.1	-2.8	-2.7
MIROC-ESM-CHEM	0.9	1.5	2.9	2.8	-0.4	-0.4	-0.1	-0.1	-2.0	-2.0	-2.1	-2.1
HadGEM2-ES	1.1	1.0	1.8	1.7	-1.6	-1.6	-1.6	-1.6	-3.1	-3.1	-3.3	-3.3
BNU-ESM	1.2	1.1	1.2	1.3	-0.8	-0.8	-1.3	-1.3	-2.8	-2.7	-2.9	-2.9
Ensemble	1.0	1.3	2.0	2.0	-0.8	-0.8	-1.0	-1.0	-2.6	-2.5	-2.8	-2.8

535

#### 536 3.2.2 Contributing factors to changes in AP



537

**Figure 7.** The seasonal changes of AP ( $\Delta$ AP) and the seasonal contribution of climatic factors to  $\Delta$ AP for Beijing and Tianjin urban areas under ISIMIP and WRF between G4 and 2010s (**a**), G4 and 2010s (**b**), G4 and RCP4.5 (**c**) and G4 and RCP8.5 (**d**) in the 2060s based on ensemble mean results. Colors and numbers in each cell correspond to color bar, and "\*" above the columns and in the cells indicate differences are significant at the 5% significant level under the Wilcoxon test.

Figure 7 shows the ISIMIP and WRF ensemble mean changes in the annual mean AP 544 anomalies G4 during 2060-2069 relative to the past and the two future RCP scenarios. 545 ISIMIP-downscaled AP (Fig. 7a-7c) shows significant anomalies (p<0.05) across the 546 whole domain, even for the relatively small differences in G4-RCP4.5. ΔAP by WRF 547 is lower than that by ISIMIP. Between G4 and 2010s, AP are projected to have increases 548 of 1.8 (1.6), 2.1 (1.8), 2.4 (-0.2), 1.8 (0.8) °C from winter to autumn in ISIMIP (WRF) 549 results. In ISIMIP results, the contribution of temperature ranges from 91%-104%, and 550 the contribution of wind speed ranges from 3%-10% in all seasons, while the 551 contribution of humidity is negative or insignificant (Fig. 7a). However, the 552 contribution of humidity is positive in WRF results (Fig. 7a). Between RCP4.5 and 553 2010s, annual mean AP is projected to increase by 3.0 °C and 1.8 °C in ISIMIP and 554 WRF results respectively, which is higher than that between G4 and 2010s. The increase 555 of temperature and decrease of wind speed have a significant impact on the annual 556 average  $\Delta AP$  contributed 97% (94%) and 4% (3%) in ISIMIP (WRF) results. The 557 contributions of changes in humidity are significantly positive under G4 and RCP4.5 in 558 WRF results, while it is the opposite in the ISIMIP results (Fig. 7a-7b). 559

560

Relative to RCP4.5 in the 2060s, AP is projected to decrease by 1.0 (0.4), 0.7 (0.8), 0.8
(0.7), and 1.3 (1.4) °C from winter to autumn under G4 in ISIMIP (WRF) results (Fig.
7c). In summer, the contribution from changes in temperature and humidity are 94%

564 (105%) and 8% (-9%) in ISIMIP (WRF) results, respectively. There are insignificant 565 contributions from wind speed under ISIMIP results, but a significant slight positive 566 contribution (0.7%-4%) under WRF results (Fig. 7c). The annual mean AP under G4 is 567 2.8 (2.6) °C lower than that under RCP8.5 in ISIMIP (WRF) result. In this case, the 568 contribution of changes in wind on  $\Delta$ AP ranges from 3%-5% by ISIMIP, while it is 569 close to 0 by WRF. As expected,  $\Delta$ AP is mainly determined by the changes in 570 temperature, with contributions usually above 90% between different scenarios.



18

Figure 8. The change of apparent temperature based on air temperature under three scenarios (G4,
RCP4.5 and RCP8.5) in four ESMs under ISIMIP (left column) and WRF (right column) for urban areas
relative to the 2010s.

575

A useful measure of heat impacts that may be missed if considering only at air 576 temperatures is the seasonality of the differences between AP and air temperature 577  $(\Delta(AP-T); Fig. 8)$ . The four model ensemble annual mean  $\Delta(AP-T)$  under ISIMIP is 578 projected to rise by 0.4°C, 0.5°C and 0.9°C under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5, relative to 579 the 2010s. Under WRF,  $\Delta$ (AP-T) is much smaller than under ISIMIP but still rising 580 faster than air temperatures: by 0.2°C, 0.3°C and 0.5°C under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 581 582 relative to the 2010s, respectively. In general, the largest anomalies in  $\Delta$ (AP-T) are in summer under both WRF and ISMIP downscaling, but the two MIROC models under 583 584 WRF have small or even negative  $\Delta$ (AP-T) in summer with WRF.

![](_page_18_Figure_3.jpeg)

#### **3.2.3 Changes of the number of days with AP>32°C**

Figure 9. Ensemble mean differences in annual number of days with AP > 32°C (NdAP\_32) between
scenarios for 2060-2069: G4-2010s (left column), G4-RCP4.5 (second column) and G4-RCP8.5 (right
column) based on ISIMIP method and WRF. 2010s means the results simulated during 2008-2017.
Stippling indicates grid points where differences or changes are not significant at the 5% level according
to the Wilcoxon signed rank test. Corresponding ISIMIP results for each ESM are in Fig. S16, and WRF
results in Fig. S17.

593

586

The NdAP 32 anomalies in Figure 9 show that ISIMIP projects an increase of about 20 594 days per year with AP>32 °C for the southeast of Beijing province and 10 days in the 595 western areas of Beijing under G4 relative to the 2010s. NdAP 32 is about 10 days 596 fewer under G4 than RCP4.5 with no clear spatial differences. G4 has about 35 fewer 597 598 NdAP 32 days in the southern part of the domain and 20 fewer days in the western 599 domain than the RCP8.5 scenario. In contrast WRF suggests that most areas do not show any significant difference between G4 and the 2010s, while the anomalies relative 600 to RCP4.5 are similar as ISIMIP, the differences are insignificant over more area than 601

ISIMIP. G4-RCP8.5 anomalies with WRF are smaller than with ISIMIP, and differences 602 are not significant in the Zhangjiakou high mountains. The urban areas show larger 603 decreases in NdAP 32 than the more rural areas, even in the low altitude plain. 604 Individual ESM show almost no statistically significant differences between G4 and 605 RCP4.5 (Fig. S16 and S17), but the differences seen in Fig. 9 are significant because of 606 the larger sample size in the significance test. All ESMs with ISIMIP show more 607 NdAP 32 in the urban areas under G4 than the 2010s, while two MIROC models 608 driving WRF show fewer NdAP 32 in Beijing-Tianjin urban areas (Fig. S16, S17). 609

610

![](_page_19_Figure_2.jpeg)

611

Figure 10. Probability density distributions of daily apparent temperature (AP) in summer (JJA) over Beijing-Tianjin urban areas under recent period (2008-2017), and the 2060s under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 scenarios from ISIMIP and WRF results. The purple dotted lines are at AP of 32°C and 39°C.

The pdf of daily apparent temperature in summer over Beijing-Tianjin urban areas (Fig.
10) shifts rightwards for G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 during the 2060s relative to the 2010s.

Figure 10 shows that by the 2060s, the dangerous threshold of AP>39 is crossed frequently under RCP8.5 with both WRF and ISIMIP downscaling, but for the RCP4.5 and G4 scenarios these events are much rarer. ISIMIP results tend to show higher probability tails (extreme events) than under WRF simulations.

622

Population weighted NdAP\_32 in the 2060s for Beijing-Tianjin province is shown in Table 3. ISIMIP downscaling suggests ensemble mean rises in NdAP\_32 of 22.4 days per year under G4 relative to the 2010s, but that G4 has 8.6 and 33.5 days per year fewer than RCP4.5 and RCP8.5, respectively. NdAP\_32 from WRF under G4 is reduced by 19.6 days per year relative to RCP8.5, and by 6.3 days relative to RCP4.5 (Table 3).

629

Table 3. Difference of population weighted NdAP\_32 between the G4 and other scenarios for BeijingTianjin province (Fig. 1c, 1d) during 2060-2069. Bold indicates the changes are significant at the 5%
level according to the Wilcoxon signed rank test. (Units: day y<sup>-1</sup>).

633

Beijing-Tianjin province	G4	-2010s	G4-RCP4.5		G4-RC	P8.5
	ISIMIP	WRF	ISIMIP	WRF	ISIMIP	WRF
MIROC-ESM	18.6	-8.1	-17.0	0.8	-35.4	-13.1
MIROC-ESM-CHEM	28.7	-10.2	3.9	-2.2	-33.7	-15.5
HadGEM2-ES	25.7	9.4	-12.5	-13.5	-24.3	-25.3
BNU-ESM	16.4	13.6	-8.6	-10.4	-40.5	-24.4
Ensemble	22.4±2.9	1.2±6.0	-8.6±4.5	-6.3±3.4	-33.5±3.4	-19.6±3.1

634

637

## 635 **3.3 PM<sub>2.5</sub> in the 2060s**

#### 636 **3.3.1 PM<sub>2.5</sub> scenarios in the 2060s**

![](_page_20_Figure_10.jpeg)

Figure 11. Spatial patterns of ensemble mean  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration difference ( $\mu g/m^3$ ) between "mitigation" under G4 in the 2060s and reference (**a**, **e**), between "mitigation" and "baseline" under G4 in the 2060s (**b**, **f**), between G4 and RCP4.5 under "mitigation" scenario in the 2060s (**c**, **g**), and

between G4 and RCP8.5 under "mitigation" scenario in the 2060s (d, h) based on ISIMIP (a-d) and
WRF (e-h) results. Excessive collinearity variables have been removed (Fig. S18 shows the results
without this procedure). Stippling indicates grid points where differences or changes are not

644 significant at the 5% significant level according to the Wilcoxon signed rank test.

645

We firstly project the change of  $PM_{2.5}$  under G4 and the aerosol mitigation scenario in 646 2060s relative to 2010s (Fig. 11a, e). Both ISIMIP and WRF project PM<sub>2.5</sub> decreases in 647 most areas, especially in Tianjin and Langfang, but PM25 decreases more under ISIMIP 648 than WRF.  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration decreases by 7.6 µg/m<sup>3</sup> over Beijing-Tianjin province 649 in ISIMIP, and decrease by 5.4  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in WRF (Table S3). PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is 0.5-8 650  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> higher in northern Beijing under G4 ("mitigation") than that during the 2010s in 651 652 WRF. To show the impact of emission reductions, we compare the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration between aerosol "baseline" and "mitigation" scenarios under G4 in the 2060s (Fig. 11b, 653 11f), and compare the "mitigation" PM2.5 concentration under G4 and the RCP 654 scenarios in the 2060s to clarify the effect of geoengineering compared with climate 655 warming. Compared with "baseline" scenario, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is less under 656 "mitigation" scenario as expected in both ISIMIP and WRF under G4 (Fig. 11b, 11f), 657 and has a similar spatial pattern with that in Fig. 11a and 11e. Compared with RCP4.5 658 and RCP8.5, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration under G4 are higher over the Beijing-Tianjin province 659 in ISIMIP results (Fig. 11c-11d), but with large differences between the 4 ESMs. G4 660 PM<sub>2.5</sub> is simulated greater than in RCP scenarios under HadGEM2-ES and BNU-ESM 661 (Fig. S19k, 1, o, p), but there are insignificant differences in most areas under the two 662 MIROC models (Fig. S19c, d, g, h). PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations are larger between G4 and 663 RCP8.5. WRF simulations shows similar changes in PM<sub>2.5</sub> between G4 and RCPs as 664 ISIMIP over Beijing-Tianjin province (Fig. 11g-h). 665

666

#### 667 3.3.2 PM<sub>2.5</sub> meteorological and emissions controls in the 2060s

![](_page_21_Figure_6.jpeg)

668

**Figure 12.** Contribution of climate factors (temperature/T, humidity/H, zonal wind/U, meridional wind/V) and emission (E) to changes in monthly  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration ( $\triangle PM_{2.5}$ ) in 2060s under G4

671 ("mitigation") relative to 2010s. Top figures (a-e) are ISIMIP results, and bottom figures (f-j) are

672 WRF results. Stippling indicates the changes are insignificant at the 5% significant level in the

673 Wilcoxon test. The grey areas represent the collinearity in the MLR, and they exist in the panel a, f

674 and h.

675

Next, we quantify the contribution of different meteorological factors and PM<sub>2.5</sub> 676 emissions to  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$  between G4 ("mitigation") in the 2060s and the 2010s (Fig. 12). 677 Both ISIMIP and WRF results show that the increase of temperature and decrease of 678 PM<sub>2.5</sub> emission play positive roles in reducing PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration. ISIMIP results (Fig. 679 12a-e), suggest that the projected increase of temperature could explain 0-20% of the 680 decrease of PM2.5 concentration, and decrease of PM2.5 emission could explain more 681 than 90% of changes in PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration differences in most of areas. Changes in 682 683 humidity and westerly winds (positive U-wind) do not cause significant changes in  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$ , but projected increases southerly wind (positive V-wind) is detrimental to the 684 685 decrease in PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration, and has a 0-10% negative effect on  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$  in Zhangjiakou. WRF results show similar spatial pattern in effect of temperature and 686 emission on  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$  with ISIMIP results. Although temperature is projected to increase 687 over the whole domain (Fig. S22), there are negative contributions on  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$  to the 688 689 north of Beijing due to increase of PM<sub>2.5</sub> caused by the negative correlation between  $PM_{2.5}$  and its emissions (Fig. S26). The ~1-2% increase of humidity leads to ~10% 690 increase of  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration in the south of Beijing (Fig. 12g), and 0.2-0.3 m/s 691 deceases of U-wind leads to 0-10% increase of PM2.5 concentration in Zhangjiakou (Fig. 692 12h). The changes in each factor in ISIMIP and WRF results are shown in Fig. S21 and 693 Fig. S22, respectively. 694

![](_page_22_Figure_3.jpeg)

695

Figure 13. Contribution of climate factors (as in Fig. 12) to changes in monthly PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration
in 2060s under G4 with aerosol "mitigation" relative to 2060s under RCP4.5 with aerosol
"mitigation". Top figures (a-e) are ISIMIP results, and bottom figures (f-j) are WRF results.
Stippling indicates the changes are insignificant at the 5% significant level in the Wilcoxon test. The
grey areas represent the collinearity in the MLR, and they exist in the panel a, f and h.

701

Now we explore the contribution of each meteorological factor to  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$  between G4 ("mitigation") and RCP4.5 ("mitigation") in the 2060s (Fig. 13). The higher PM<sub>2.5</sub> under G4 is mainly caused by the lower temperature. In ISIMIP, lower temperature explains more than 90% (100% in some places) of the raised PM<sub>2.5</sub> relative to RCP4.5,

although the increase of humidity is also helpful to lower PM2.5 in the western domain 706 (Fig. 13a-b). Humidity can increase suspended particle mass and coagulation, 707 promoting deposition (Li et al., 2015). The contribution of differences in U-wind and 708 V-wind on  $\Delta PM_{2.5}$  is insignificant (Fig. 13c-d). In WRF, the projected lower 709 temperatures explain more than 70% of the higher PM2.5 under G4 relative to RCP4.5 710 (Fig. 13e). Although the increase of southerly (V) wind contributes 10-20% to the 711 higher PM<sub>2.5</sub> in the northern domain under HadGEM2-ES and BNU-ESM (Fig. S24), 712 it is insignificant in the ensemble (Fig. 13h). Decreased westerlies (U wind) explains 713 about between +100% and -100% of PM2.5 differences (Fig. 13g), since U-wind impacts 714 vary spatially (Fig. S26). 715

716

#### 717 **3.3.3 PM<sub>2.5</sub> impact on health risks now and in the 2060s**

Changes in RR of PM<sub>2.5</sub> for the 5 diseases under the geoengineering and global 718 warming climate scenarios and different emission scenarios during 2060s relative to 719 720 2010s for the Beijing-Tianjin province are shown in Fig. 14. Present-day PM<sub>2.5</sub> related RRs are 1.32 (1.30), 1.37 (1.35), 1.46 (1.43), 1.83 (1.80) and 2.03 (1.99) for chronic 721 obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), ischemic heart disease (IHD), lung cancer (LC), 722 lung respiratory infection (LRI) and stroke according to the ISIMIP (WRF) simulations 723 (Fig. 14a). RR of LRI is the highest and COPD is the lowest in the five diseases, and 724 WRF estimates of RR are 0.02-0.03 lower than those of ISIMIP. In both the "baseline" 725 and "mitigation" emission scenarios, RRs will be lower under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 726 compared with the 2010s. Smaller RR reductions occur under G4 than under RCP4.5 727 and RCP8.5, and ISIMIP simulates larger reductions than WRF. This is because the 728 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations from ISIMIP are reduced more than with WRF (Table S3). Under 729 the "baseline" emission scenario (Fig. 14b-d), the biggest reduction of RR for LRI is 730 0.047 under RCP8.5 in ISIMIP, and RRs for other diseases are projected to reduce by 731 732 no more than 0.02. Under the "mitigation" emission scenario (Fig. 14e-g), reductions 733 in RRs are 3-6 times greater.

![](_page_24_Figure_0.jpeg)

734

Figure 14. Average population-weighted relative risks of PM<sub>2.5</sub> related 5 diseases in 2010s (a) and its changes between G4 and 2010s (b, e), between RCP4.5 and 2010s (c, f) and between RCP8.5 and 2010s (d, g) in Beijing-Tianjin province based on the ISIMIP and WRF results, respectively. PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is based on the "baseline" emissions under G4, RCP4,5 and RCP8.5 in the middle 3 figures (b-d), and it is based on the "mitigation" emissions under G4, RCP4,5 and RCP8.5 in the bottom 3 figures (e-g).

## 742 **4. Discussion**

## 743 **4.1 Apparent temperature**

744

Both ISIMIP and WRF can reproduce the observed (CN05.1) spatial patterns and
seasonal variabilities of apparent temperature in the region around Beijing. WRF shows
warm biases in AP during all months relative to CN05.1 due to warmer temperatures in
urban areas, with the exception of BNU-ESM and HadGEM2-ES driven summers (Fig.
S13). Both ISIMIP and WRF tend to overestimate population weighted NdAP\_32 by

370% and 590%, respectively. These large discrepancies are due to relatively small 750 overestimates of the likelihood of the tails of the probability distributions which leads 751 to a dramatic increase in the frequency of extreme climate events (Dimri et al., 2018; 752 Huang et al., 2021). AP is about 1.5°C warmer than 2 m temperature over the Beijing 753 and Tianjin urban areas in summer due to higher vapor pressures amplifying warmer 754 755 urban temperatures, and this is despite humidity being lower over the cities. Under high humidity conditions, a slight increase in temperature will cause a large increase in heat 756 stress (Li et al., 2018; Luo and Lau, 2019). AP is nearly 4°C colder than 2 m temperature 757 in winter due to wind speed (Fig. 2d). Differences between AP and 2 m temperature 758 (AP-T) during summer are greater in urban areas than neighboring rural areas. 759

760

761 The apparent temperatures in Beijing Tianjin urban areas under G4 in the 2060s are simulated to be 1°C and 2.5°C lower than RCP4.5 and RCP8.5, although AP would be 762 higher than in the recent past. The cooling effect of G4 relative to RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 763 is greatest under HadGEM2-ES (Fig. S14, S15), due to the ESM having largest 764 temperature differences between scenarios (Wang et al., 2022). WRF downscaling 765 produces reduced seasonality in AP compared with ISIMIP, and WRF produces 766 relatively cooler summers and warmer winters than ISIMIP, and so much less 767 differences in apparent temperature ranges (Fig. 15). Differences in AP between G4 and 768 the RCP scenarios are mainly driven by temperature. In all scenarios and downscalings 769 AP rises faster than the temperature due to decreased wind speeds in the future (Li et 770 al., 2018; Zhu et al., 2021) but mainly because of rises in vapor pressure driven by 771 rising temperatures. This effect occurs despite the general drying expected under solar 772 773 geoengineering (Bala et al., 2008; Yu et al., 2015).

774

The NdAP\_32 under G4 is projected to decrease by 8.6 days per year by ISIMIP and 6.3 days per year by WRF relative to RCP4.5 for Beijing-Tianjin Province. Much larger reductions in NdAP\_32 of 33.5 days per year (ISIMIP) and 19.6 days per year (WRF) are projected relative to RCP8.5. Differences between scenarios in frequency of dangerously hot days are far larger using ISIMIP statistical downscaling than using WRF. This is another impact of the reduced seasonality of WRF compared with ISIMIP (Fig. 15).

782

783 The higher resolution WRF simulation produces a much larger range of apparent temperatures across the domain than CN05.1 and ISIMIP downscaling. This increased 784 variability makes reaching a statistical significance threshold more challenging for 785 WRF than ISIMIP results. Despite this, the ESM-driven differences in WRF output are 786 less than from ISIMIP, reflecting the physically based processes in the dynamic WRF 787 simulation. This reduces the impact of differences in ESM forcing at the domain 788 boundaries with WRF compared with the statistical bias correction and downscaling 789 methods. Although there are some uncertainties between models and downscaling 790 791 methods, G4 SAI can not only reduce the mean apparent temperature but also decrease the probability of PDF tails (extreme events) in summer. 792

![](_page_26_Figure_0.jpeg)

Figure 15. Seasonal cycles of apparent temperature from MIROC-ESM, MIROC-ESM-CHEM,
HadGEM2-ES and BNU-ESM under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 in Beijing-Tianjin urban areas during
2060s based on ISIMIP (red) and WRF (black) methods.

798

## 799 4.2 PM<sub>2.5</sub>

We established a set spatially gridded MLR models based on the 4 ESMs downscaled variables under ISIMIP and WRF. The meteorological factors impact  $PM_{2.5}$  in complex ways, but the simple spatially gridded MLR models display enough skill to make some illustrative projections of future  $PM_{2.5}$  explaining about 70% of the variance during the historical period.  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration is correlated with emissions and anti-correlated

with temperature in most parts of the domain (Fig, S25-S26). Increased turbulence 805 increases diffusion of PM<sub>2.5</sub> (Yang et al., 2016), and higher temperatures increase 806 evaporation losses (Liu et al., 2015) of ammonium nitrate (Chuang et al., 2017), and 807 other components (Wang et al., 2006). Humidity may have both positive and negative 808 effects on PM<sub>2.5</sub> (Chen et al., 2020). It causes more water vapor to adhere to the surface 809 of PM<sub>2.5</sub>, thereby increasing its mass concentration and facilitating aerosol growth 810 (Cheng et al., 2017; Liao et al., 2017). However, when the humidity exceeds a certain 811 threshold, coagulation and particle mass increases rapidly, promoting deposition (Li et 812 al., 2015). So, the slope coefficients between  $PM_{2.5}$  and humidity are positive in low 813 humidity areas, including southern plain and the Beijing-Tianjin province, but negative 814 in some northern mountain areas (Fig. S25, S26). 815

816

There are large spatial differences in wind speed and direction impacts on PM<sub>2.5</sub>. Yang 817 et al. (2016) found that weaker northerly and westerly winds tend to increase the PM<sub>2.5</sub> 818 concentration in northern and eastern China, respectively. The effects of wind direction 819 820 depend on the distribution of emitted PM<sub>2.5</sub> and the condition of the underlying surface 821 (Chen et al., 2020). Most sources of  $PM_{2.5}$  lie to the south of our domain, relatively clean conditions prevail to the north, so northly winds tend to advect clean air, while 822 southerlies bring high concentrations of aerosols. Weak winds tend to increase PM<sub>2.5</sub> 823 and smog formation due to sinking air and weak diffusion (Su et al., 2017; Yang et al., 824 2017). 825

826

Xu et al. (2021) projected 2030 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations will decrease by 8.8% and 5.5% 827 under RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 respectively relative to 2015. Wang et al. (2021) also 828 projected decreasing trends in China under RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 during 2030-2050. 829 There were seasonal changes in PM2.5 concentration differences between RCP4.5/8.5 830 scenarios and the historical scenario near the Bohai Sea (Dou et al., 2021). However, 831 832 there are also some simulations where PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations increase in warmer climates. Hong et al. (2019) suggest that annual mean PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations will increase 1-8 833  $\mu g/m^3$  in an area including Beijing and Tianjin under RCP4.5 during 2046-2050, 834 compared with 2006-2010. These inconsistent responses are mainly caused by the 835 differences in the selection of ESMs, chemical transport models and climate/emission 836 837 scenarios. Different RCP scenarios not only correspond to different future climate states, but also have different anthropogenic emissions of air pollutants. In our study, we do 838 not consider the PM2.5 emission differences between RCP4.5 and RCP8.5, and instead 839 applied the ECLIPSE PM<sub>2.5</sub> emission scenarios in our MLR projection. 840

841

Emissions reductions are expected to play the dominant role in the decrease of  $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations under G4 aerosol "mitigation" in 2060s (Fig. 12). Meteorological changes under the different future scenarios make much smaller changes as evidenced by the scenarios using "baseline" – that is present day  $PM_{2.5}$  emissions, with decreases in mean annual concentration of 1.0 (1.3), 1.8 (2.0), 3.3 (3.2) µg/m<sup>3</sup> over Beijing-

Tianjin province under G4, RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 with WRF (ISIMIP), (Table S3), which 847 are mainly caused by the temperature increases (Fig. 13). The negative relationships 848 between emission and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration result in the increase of PM<sub>2.5</sub> under G4 849 ("mitigation") relative to 2010s in the north of Beijing with WRF. This may be due to 850 changes in PM2.5 out of the domain being opposite to those in domain during the MLR 851 fitting period, since relocation of polluting sources from the urban areas mainly to the 852 west, was occurring over the calibration period. The accuracy of PM2.5 emission data is 853 also crucial for training MLR models, and PM2.5 data was sparse before 2013, relying 854 on reconstructions based on satellite optical depth estimates. Although both increase of 855 temperature and decrease of emission explain more than 90% of the decrease in PM<sub>2.5</sub> 856 in most areas, there are large spatial differences due to wind and humidity. On the one 857 hand, there is uncertainty in the differences in changes of wind speed and humidity 858 859 between different ESMs and downscaling methods; on the other hand, the complex physical relationship between them and PM2.5 also increases uncertainties. Reductions 860 in PM<sub>2.5</sub> in the future are projected to decrease PM<sub>2.5</sub> related health issues, although its 861 effect on different diseases are different. Changes in PM2.5 related risk between G4 and 862 RCPs are from 1-3%, with PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions policy dominating differences over climate 863 864 scenario.

865

There are some differences in projecting PM2.5 concentration between WRF and ISIMIP 866 methods. Compared to the 2010s reference, PM2.5 concentration in ISIMIP are 867 projected to decrease more than using WRF in G4 under the "mitigation" scenario 868 during the 2060s over the Tianjin province (Fig. 11a, e). However, the spatial patterns 869 of changes in PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration between G4 and RCP4.5/8.5 under the "mitigation" 870 scenario during 2060s are similar (Fig. 11c-d, g-h). This means that the effects of 871 different downscaled methods on projecting PM<sub>2.5</sub> are small if we only consider the 872 873 climate change alone without considering emissions changes. Due to the larger regression coefficient of emissions in the MLR under the ISIMIP method (Fig. S25, 874 S26), the negative changes in PM2.5 concentration are larger between "mitigation" and 875 baseline under G4 during 2060s than that under the WRF method. Correspondingly, the 876 ISIMIP method has a greater reduction in PM2.5 related RR than WRF under three future 877 climate scenarios during the 2060s. 878

879

Eastham et al. (2018) deduced from experiments using 1 Tg/yr SAI in a coupled 880 chemistry-transport model directly simulating atmospheric chemistry, transport, 881 radiative transfer of UV, emissions, and loss processes, that per unit mass emitted, 882 surface-level emissions of sulfate result in 25 times greater population exposure to 883 PM<sub>2.5</sub> than emitting the same aerosol into the stratosphere. The G4 experiment specifies 884 5 Tg/yr injection rate, which over our domain would equate to 1450 t/yr if it was 885 deposited uniformly globally (which it certainly would not be). Reducing this by the 886 1/25 factor amounts to 58 t/yr which can be compared with present PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions of 887 around  $3.3 \times 10^5$  t/year in our domain. If we consider the aerosol deposition under G4 888 scenarios,  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration will be 0-1  $\mu g/m^3$  higher than that without due to 889

deposition of the SAI aerosols (Fig. S27), and RR is projected to increase by 0.01% for
Beijing-Tianjin province (Table S4). This comparison suggests that tropospheric
emissions will be much more important for human health in our domain than from the
SAI specified by G4.

894

The most important change in  $PM_{2.5}$  will come from emissions reductions, with the 895 different weather conditions under both G4 and RCP scenarios making relatively little 896 practical differences in concentrations. PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is expected to decrease 897 significantly (ISIMIP: -7.6µg/m<sup>3</sup>, WRF: -5.4 µg/m<sup>3</sup>) in the Beijing-Tianjin province, 898 but they will still not meet either Chinese or international standards. The temperature 899 under G4 is lower than that under RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 scenarios, which makes the 900 901 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration under G4 higher. But the difference in PM<sub>2.5</sub> between the two is small and even within uncertainty due to projected differences in humidity and wind. 902 Potentially improved estimates from more complex models such as WRF-Chem, 903 CMAQ and GEOS-Chem over the simple MLR methods used here will be of limited 904 value unless the differences between the ESM driving these models is reduced. It can 905 be confirmed that emission policies based on the 13<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan are not enough. 906 and higher emission standards need to be developed for a healthy living environment. 907

908

Our study did not consider the impacts of socio-economic pathways on PM<sub>2.5</sub> future 909 emissions, instead we explore the meteorological differences between the SAI G4 910 scenario and the greenhouse gas RCP4.5/RCP8.5 on PM2.5 concentrations. PM2.5 911 emissions were defined by the uncontrolled ("baseline") and a scenario where 912 technological intervention ("mitigation") reduces emissions. There are some limitations 913 914 in our study. Firstly, the HTAP\_V3 dataset only includes anthropogenic PM<sub>2.5</sub> emission, not natural PM<sub>2.5</sub> emission. Natural PM<sub>2.5</sub> will also change in the future under changing 915 climate. The sources of natural PM<sub>2.5</sub> include the sandstorms that sometimes occur in 916 917 spring as extreme winds mobilize dry unvegetated soils. These relatively extreme conditions are difficult to simulate in ESM and subject to land use policy e.g., the 918 numerous ecosystem service measures undertaken by China over the last five decades 919 (Miao et al., 2015). Secondly, although PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration includes both primary and 920 secondary PM<sub>2.5</sub> during model training, we do not consider the precursor gases for 921 secondary PM<sub>2.5</sub> directly. The sensitivity of MLR may diminish at the high PM<sub>2.5</sub> values 922 923 when secondary PM<sub>2.5</sub> dominates the variability of total PM<sub>2.5</sub> (Upadhyay et al., 2018). Thirdly, we only consider the effect of dominant near-surface meteorological variables 924 on the PM<sub>2.5</sub>. However, the vertical transport of pollutants related to vertical 925 atmospheric stability should not be ignored (Lo et al., 2006; Wu et al., 2005), and this 926 may contribute to the differences in RCP4.5 scenario from our MLR model and more 927 928 sophisticated simulations (Fig. S7). Finally, although it is insignificant for the Beijing and Tianjin provinces, the MLR model suffers collinearity problems in some areas. 929 These factors play smaller roles as we are mainly considering changes in PM<sub>2.5</sub> 930 concentration between different climate scenarios. Nevertheless, projection for changes 931

in PM<sub>2.5</sub> between SAI scenarios and per greenhouse gas scenarios would be valuable
 for global air quality impacts from geoengineering.

934

## 935 **5. Conclusion**

Our study on thermal comfort and aerosol pollution under geoengineering scenarios for 936 the Beijing megalopolis may be useful across the developing world, which is expected 937 to suffer disproportionate climate impact damages relative the global mean, while also 938 undergoing rapid urbanization. Assessing health impacts and mortality due to heat 939 stress and PM<sub>2.5</sub> under greenhouse gas scenarios should consider urbanization and the 940 change to concrete surfaces from vegetation that leads to differences in heat capacities, 941 942 rates of evapotranspiration, and hence humidity and apparent temperature. These require downscaled analyses, accurate meteorological and high-resolution land surface 943 datasets, and industrial development scenarios. 944

945

946 In our analysis we assumed the urban area did not change over time, and also that 947 population remains distributed as in the recent past. This may be reasonable in the highly developed and relatively mature greater Beijing-Tianjin region but should be 948 considered in rapidly urbanizing regions elsewhere. There certainly will be changes 949 over time in the radiative cooling from surface pollution sources. PM<sub>2.5</sub> is a health issue 950 in many developing regions (Ran et al., 2023), but as wealth increases efforts to curb 951 air pollution generally clean the air. This has clear health benefits, but also removes 952 aerosols from the troposphere that cool the surface. The urban areas that have higher 953 apparent temperatures at present are also the areas with greatest aerosol load and hence 954 greatest cooling. Once that is removed direct radiation, air temperatures and apparent 955 temperatures will all rise - by several degrees (Wang et al., 2016). So, a future more 956 comprehensive health impact study would include both the negative health impacts of 957 958 aerosol pollution and the potential cooling effects those aerosols produce. Additionally, 959 the formulation of apparent temperature used does not consider the effect of radiation on human comfort (Kong and Huber, 2022). When PM<sub>2.5</sub> levels are high there is no 960 shade because the sky is milky-white, similarly SAI will brighten the sky (Kravitz et 961 al., 2012). Comfort is increased in clear sky conditions when shade is readily found. 962

963

The changes simulated to relative risk from increased PM2.5 under the G4 SAI scenario 964 are about 1-3% worse than under RCP4.5, mainly because of lower temperatures under 965 G4. The difference this would make to the overall health burden under SAI depends on 966 the range of other impacts that include changes in apparent temperature we discuss. G4 967 reduces the number of days with AP>32 (when extreme caution is advised) by 6-8 per 968 year relative to RCP4.5 and by 20-34 relative to RCP8.5. But G4 itself will still increase 969 970 these extreme caution days by 1-20 relative to conditions in the 2010s. Lowering PM2.5 971 emissions will increase ground temperatures and the associated risk of dangerous apparent temperatures will also increase rapidly as the distribution of temperatures is 972 shifted making presently rare hot events into much more frequent heat waves. 973

#### 974 Code and data availability

All ESM data used in this work are available from the Earth System Grid Federation
(WCRP, 2021; https://esgf-node.llnl.gov/projects/cmip6, last access: 14 July 2021).
The WRF and ISIMIP bias-corrected and downscaled results are available for the
authors on request. WRF and ISIMIP codes are freely available at the references cited
in the methods sections.

#### 980 Supplement link

981 The link to the supplement will be included by Copernicus.

#### 982 Author contribution

JCM and LZ designed the experiments, JW performed the simulations. All the authorswrote the manuscript.

#### 985 **Competing interests**

986 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

#### 987 Disclaimer

988 Publisher's note: Copernicus Publications remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional 989 claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

#### 990 Special issue statement:

991 This article is part of the special issue "Resolving uncertainties in solar geoengineering

992 through multi-model and large-ensemble simulations (ACP/ESD inter-journal SI)". It 993 is not associated with a conference.

#### 994 Acknowledgements

We thank the editor and two constrictive referees for improving the manuscript. This
work relies on the climate modeling groups participating in the Geoengineering Model
Intercomparison Project and their model development teams; the CLIVAR/WCRP
Working Group on Coupled Modeling for endorsing the GeoMIP; and the scientists
managing the earth system grid data nodes who have assisted with making GeoMIP
output available. This research was funded by the National Key Science Program for
Global Change Research (2015CB953602).

### 1003 **References**

- Burnett, R., Pope III, C., Ezzati, M., Olives, C., Lim, S., Mehta, S., Shin, H., Singh, G.,
  Hubbell, B., Brauer, M., Anderson, A., Smith, K., Balmes, J., Bruce, N., Kan, H.,
  Laden, F., Prüss-Ustün, A., Turner, M., Gapstur, S., Diver, W., and Cohen, A.: An
  Integrated Risk Function for Estimating the Global Burden of Disease Attributable
  to Ambient Fine Particulate Matter Exposure, Environ., Health Perspect., 122, 397403, https://doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1307049, 2014.
- Bala, G., Duffy, P. B., Taylor, K. E.: Impact of geoengineering schemes on the global
  hydrological cycle, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 105 (22), 7664-7669,
  https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0711648105, 2008.
- 1013 Chen, Z., Cai, J., Gao, B., Xu, B., Dai, S., He, B., Xie, X.: Detecting the causality
  1014 influence of individual meteorological factors on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in the
  1015 Jing-Jin-Ji region, Sci. Rep., 7, 40735, https://doi.org/10.1038/srep40735, 2017.
- 1016 Chen, Z., Chen, D., Kwan, M.-P., Chen, B., Gao, B., Zhuang, Y., Li, R., and Xu, B.: The
  1017 control of anthropogenic emissions contributed to 80% of the decrease in
  1018 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in Beijing from 2013 to 2017, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 19, 13519–
  1019 13533, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-19-13519-2019, 2019.
- Chen, Z., Chen, D., Zhao, C., Kwan, M., Cai, J., Zhuang, Y., Zhao, B., Wang, X., Chen, 1020 1021 B., Yang, J., Li, R., He, B., Gao, B., Wang, K., and Xu, B.: Influence of meteorological conditions on PM2.5 concentrations across China: A review of 1022 1023 methodology and mechanism, Environ. Int., 139, 105558, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2020.105558, 2020. 1024
- 1025 Chen, Z., Xie, X., Cai, J., Chen, D., Gao, B., He, B., Cheng, N., and Xu, B.:
  1026 Understanding meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China: a
  1027 temporal and spatial perspective, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 5343–5358,
  1028 https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-18-5343-2018, 2018.
- 1029 Cheng, L., Meng, F., Chen, L., Jiang, T., and Su, L.: Effects on the haze pollution from
  autumn crop residue burning over the Jing-Jin-Ji Region, China Environ. Sci., 37,
  1031 2801–2812, 2017.
- 1032 Chi, X., Li, R., Cubasch, U., Cao, W.: The thermal comfort and its changes in the 31
  1033 provincial capital cities of mainland China in the past 30 years, Theor. Appl.
  1034 Climatol., 132(1-2), 599–619, 2018.
- 1035 Chuang, M., Chou, C., Lin, N., Takami, A., Hsiao, T., Lin, T., Fu, J., Pani, S., Lu, Y., and
  1036 Yang, T.: A simulation study on PM<sub>2.5</sub> sources and meteorological characteristics at
  1037 the northern tip of Taiwan in the early stage of the Asian haze period, Aerosol Air
  1038 Qual. Res., 17, 3166-3178, https://doi.org/10.4209/aaqr.2017.05.0185, 2017.
- Collins, W. J., Bellouin, N., Doutriaux-Boucher, M., Gedney, N., Halloran, P., Hinton,
  T., Hughes, J., Jones, C. D., Joshi, M., Liddicoat, S., Martin, G., O'Connor, F., Rae,
  J., Senior, C., Sitch, S., Totterdell, I., Wiltshire, A., Woodward, S.: Development
  and evaluation of an Earth-System model HadGEM2, Geosci. Model Dev., 4,
  1043 1051–1075, https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-4-1051-2011, 2011.
- 1044 Curry, C. L., Sillmann, J., Bronaugh, D., Alterskjaer, K., Cole, J. N. S., Ji, D., Kravitz,
- 1045 B., Kristjánsson, J. E., Moore, J. C., Muri, H., Niemeier, U., Robock, A., Tilmes, S.,

- and Yang, S.: A multimodel examination of climate extremes in an idealized
  geoengineering experiment, J. Geophys. Res.-Atmos., 119, 3900–3923,
  https://doi.org/10.1002/2013JD020648, 2014.
- 1049 Dimri, A. P., Kumar, D., Choudhary, A., Maharana, P.: Future changes over the
  1050 Himalayas: Maximum and minimum temperature, Global and Planetary Change,
  1051 162, 212-234, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2018.01.015, 2018.
- Dou, C., Ji, Z., Xiao, Y., Zhu, X., and Dong, W.: Projections of air pollution in northern
  China in the two RCPs scenarios, Remote Sens., 13, 3064,
  https://doi.org/10.3390/rs13163064, 2021.
- Eastham, D., Weisenstein, D., Keith, D., and Barrett, A.: Quantifying the impact of
  sulfate geoengineering on mortality from air quality and UV-B exposure, Atmos.
  Environ., 187, 424–434. DOI: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.05.047</u>,
  2018.
- Fan, M., Zhang, Y., Lin, Y., Cao, F., Sun, Y., Qiu, Y., Xing, G., Dao, X., and Fu, P.:
  Specific sources of health risks induced by metallic elements in PM<sub>2.5</sub> during the
  wintertime in Beijing, China, Atmos. Environ., 246, 118112,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2020.118112, 2021.
- Fischer, E., and Knutti, R.: Robust projections of combined humidity and temperature
  extremes, Nat. Clim. Change, 3, 126-130, <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1682</u>,
  2013.
- Foley, K. M., Roselle, S. J., Appel, K. W., Bhave, P. V., Pleim, J. E., Otte, T. L., Mathur,
  R., Sarwar, G., Young, J. O., Gilliam, R. C., Nolte, C. G., Kelly, J. T., Gilliland, A.
  B., and Bash, J. O.: Incremental testing of the Community Multiscale Air Quality
  (CMAQ) modeling system version 4.7, Geosci. Model Dev., 3, 205–226,
  https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-3-205-2010, 2010.
- Fu, J., Jiang, D., Huang, Y.: 1 km Grid Population Dataset of China, Digital Journal of
  Global Change Data Repository, https://doi.org/10.3974/geodb.2014.01.06.V1,
  2014.
- Garcia, F. C., Bestion, E., Warfield, R., Yvon-Durocher, G.: Changes in temperature alter
  the relationship between biodiversity and ecosystem functioning, Proc. Natl. Acad.
  Sci. U.S.A., 115, 10989–10999, https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1805518115, 2018.
- Grinsted, A., Moore, J., and Jevrejeva, S.: Projected Atlantic tropical cyclone threat from
  rising temperatures, PNAS, 110, 5369-5373, https://doi/10.1073/pnas.1209980110,
  2013.
- Grundstein, A. and Dowd, J.: Trends in extreme apparent temperatures over the United
  States, 1949-2010, J. Appl, Meteorol. Climatol., 50(8), 1650–1653,
  https://doi.org/10.1175/JAMC-D-11-063.1, 2011.
- Guan, W., Zheng, X., Chung, K., and Zhong, N.: Impact of air pollution on the burden
  of chronic respiratory diseases in China: time for urgent action, Lancet, 388, 19391951, https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(16)31597-5, 2016.
- Guo, L., Zhang, Y., Lin, H., Zeng, W., Liu, T., Xiao, J., Rutherford, S., You, J., Ma, W.:
  The washout effects of rainfall on atmospheric particulate pollution in two Chinese
  cities, Environ. Pollut., 215, 195-202, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2016.05.003,
  2016.

- Han, J., Wang, J., Zhao, Y., Wang, Q., Zhang, B., Li, H., and Zhai, J.: Spatio-temporal
  variation of potential evapotranspiration and climatic drivers in the Jing-Jin-Ji region,
  North China, Agric. For. Meteorol., 256, 75-83,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2018.03.002, 2018.
- Hempel, S., Frieler, K., Warszawski, L., Schewe, J., and Piontek, F.: A trend-preserving
  bias correction the ISI-MIP approach, Earth Syst. Dynam., 4, 219–236,
  https://doi.org/10.5194/esd-4-219-2013, 2013.
- Hersbach, H., Bell, B., Berrisford, P., Biavati, G., Horányi, A., Muñoz Sabater, J.,
  Nicolas, J., Peubey, C., Radu, R., Rozum, I., Schepers, D., Simmons, A., Soci, C.,
  Dee, D., Thépaut, J-N.: ERA5 hourly data on pressure levels from 1979 to present,
  Copernicus Climate Change Service (C3S) Climate Data Store (CDS),
  https://doi.org/10.24381/cds.bd0915c6, 2018.
- Ho, H. C., Knudby, A., Xu, Y., Hodul, M., Aminipouri, M.: A comparison of urban heat
  islands mapped using skin temperature, air temperature, and apparent temperature
  (Humidex), for the greater Vancouver area, Science of The Total Environment, 544,
  929-938, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.12.021, 2016.
- Hong, C., Zhang, Q., Zhang, Y., Davis, S., Tong, D., Zheng, Y., Liu, Z., Guan, D., He,
  K., and Schellnhuber, H. J.: Impacts of climate change on future air quality and
  human health in China, PNAS, 116, 17193-17200,
  https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1812881116, 2019.
- Huang, J., Li, Q., Song, Z.: Historical global land surface air apparent temperature and
  its future changes based on CMIP6 projections, Science of The Total Environment,
  816, 151656, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.151656, 2021.
- IPCC, 2021. Climate change 2021: the physical science basis. In: Masson-Delmotte, V.,
  Zhai, P., Pirani, A., Connors, S.L., Péan, C., Berger, S., Caud, N., Chen, Y., Goldfarb,
  L., Gomis, M.I., Huang, M., Leitzell, K., Lonnoy, E., Matthews, J.B.R., Maycock,
  T.K., Waterfifield, T., Yelekçi, O., Yu, R., B.Z. (Eds.), Contribution of Working
  Group I to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate
  Change. Cambridge University Press In Press.
- Jacobs, S. J., Pezza, A. B., Barras, V., Bye, J., Vihma, T.: An analysis of the
  meteorological variables leading to apparent temperature in Australia: present
  climate, trends, and global warming simulations, Glob. Planet. Chang., 107, 145–
  156, 2013.
- Janssens-Maenhout, G., Crippa, M., Guizzardi, D., Dentener, F., Muntean, M., Pouliot,
  G., Keating, T., Zhang, Q., Kurokawa, J., Wankmüller, R., Denier van der Gon, H.,
  Kuenen, J. J. P., Klimont, Z., Frost, G., Darras, S., Koffi, B., and Li, M.: HTAP\_v2.2:
  a mosaic of regional and global emission grid maps for 2008 and 2010 to study
  hemispheric transport of air pollution, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15, 11411-11432,
  https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-15-11411-2015, 2015.
- Ji, D., Fang, S., Curry, C. L., Kashimura, H., Watanabe, S., Cole, J. N. S., Lenton, A.,
  Muri, H., Kravita, B., Moore, J. C.: Extreme temperature and precipitation response
  to solar dimming and stratospheric aerosol geoengineering, Atmospheric Chemistry
  and Physics, 18, 10133-10156, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-18-10133-2018, 2018.
- 1133 Ji, D., Wang, L., Feng, J., Wu, Q., Cheng, H., Zhang, Q., Yang, J., Dong, W., Dai, Y.,

- Gong, D., Zhang, R.-H., Wang, X., Liu, J., Moore, J. C., Chen, D., and Zhou, M.:
  Description and basic evaluation of Beijing Normal University Earth System Model
  (BNU-ESM) version 1, Geosci. Model Dev., 7, 2039–2064,
  https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-7-2039-2014, 2014.
- Jin, H., Chen, X., Zhong, R., and Liu, M.: Influence and prediction of PM<sub>2.5</sub> through
  multiple environmental variables in China, Sci. Total Enviro., 849, 157910,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.157910, 2022.
- Jones, A. C., Hawcroft, M. K., Haywood, J. M., Jones, A., Guo, X., Moore, J.C.:
  Regional climate impacts of stabilizing global warming at 1.5 K using solar
  geoengineering, Earth's Future, 6, https://doi.org/10.1002/2017EF000720, 2018.
- Kim, D. H., Shin, H. J., Chung, I. U.: Geoengineering: Impact of marine cloud
  brightening control on the extreme temperature change over East Asia, Atmosphere,
  11(12), 1345, https://doi.org/10.3390/atmos11121345, 2020.
- Klimont, Z., Kupiainen, K., Heyes, C., Purohit, P., Cofala, J., Rafaj, P., Borken-Kleefeld, 1147 J., and Schöpp, W.: Global anthropogenic emissions of particulate matter including 1148 black carbon, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 8681-8723, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-17-1149 1150 8681-2017, 2017.Kong, Q., and Huber, M.: Explicit calculations of wet-bulb globe temperature compared with approximations and why it matters for labor productivity, 1151 e2021EF002334, https://doi.org/10.1029/2021EF002334, Earth's Future, 10. 1152 2022.Kraaijenbrink, P. D. A., Bierkens, M. F. P., Lutz A. F., Immerzeel, W. W.: 1153 Impact of a global temperature rise of 1.5 degrees Celsius on Asia's glaciers, Nature, 1154 549, 257-260, https://doi.org/10.1038/nature23878, 2017. 1155
- Kravitz, B., MacMartin, D., and Caldeira, K.: Geoengineering: Whiter skies?, Geophys.
  Res. Lett., 39, L11801, <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2012GL051652</u>, 2012.
- Kravitz, B., Robock, A., Boucher, O., Schmidt, H., Taylor, K. E., Stenchikov, G., and
  Schulz, M.: The geoengineering model intercomparison project (GeoMIP), Atmos.
  Sci. Lett., 12(2), 162-167, https://doi.org/10.1002/asl.316, 2011.
- Kuswanto, H., Kravitz, B., Miftahurrohmah, B., Fauzi, F., Sopahaluwaken, A., and
  Moore, J. C.: Impact of solar geoengineering on temperatures over the Indonesian
  Maritime Continent, Int. J. Climatol., 1-20, https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.7391, 2021.
- Lee, C. and Sheridan, S.: A new approach to modeling temperature-related mortality:
  non-linear autoregressive models with exogenous input, Environ. Res., 164:53–64,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2018.02.020, 2018.
- Lenton, T. and Vaughan, N.: The radiative forcing potential of different climate
  geoengineering options, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 9, 5539–5561,
  https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-9-5539-2009, 2009.
- Li, D., Wu, Q., Feng, J., Wang, Y., Wang, L., Xu, Q., Sun, Y., Cao, K., and Cheng, H.:
  The influence of anthropogenic emissions on air quality in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei of
  China around 2050 under the future climate scenario, J. Cleaner Prod., 388, 135927,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2023.135927, 2023.
- Li, J., Chen, H., Li, Z., Wang, P., Cribb, M., and Fan, X.: Low-level temperature
  inversions and their effect on aerosol condensation nuclei concentrations under
  different large-scale synoptic circulations, Adv. Atmos. Sci., 32, 898-908,
  https://doi.org/10.1007/s00376-014-4150-z, 2015.

- Li, J., Chen, Y., Gan, T., Lau, N.: Elevated increases in human-perceived temperature
  under climate warming, Nat. Clim. Chang., 8 (1), 43–47,
  https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-017-0036-2, 2018.
- Li, K., Liao, H., Zhu, J., and Moch, J.: Implications of RCP emissions on future PM<sub>2.5</sub>
  air quality and direct radiative forcing over China, J. Geophys. Res. Atmos., 121, 12,
  985-13, 008, https:// doi:10.1002/2016JD025623, 2016.
- Li, M., Klimont, Z., Zhang, Q., Martin, R. V., Zheng, B., Heyes, C., Cofala, J., Zhang,
  Y., and He, K.: Comparison and evaluation of anthropogenic emissions of SO<sub>2</sub> and
  NO<sub>x</sub> over China, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 3433–3456, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp18-3433-2018, 2018.
- Liao, T., Wang, S., Ai, J., Gui, K., Duan, B., Zhao, Q., Zhang, X., Jiang, W., and Sun, Y.:
  Heavy pollution episodes, transport pathways and potential sources of PM<sub>2.5</sub> during
  the winter of 2013 in Chengdu (China), Sci. Total Environ., 584–585, 1056–1065,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.01.160, 2017.
- Lin, G., Fu, J., Jiang, D., Wang, J., Wang, Q., and Dong, D.: Spatial variation of the
  relationship between PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and meteorological parameters in China,
  BioMed Res. Int., 2015, 684618, https://doi.org/10.1155/2015/684618, 2015.
- Lo, J., Lau, A., Fung, J., and Chen, F.: Investigation of enhanced cross-city transport and
  trapping of air pollutants by coastal and urban land-sea breeze circulations, J.
  Geophys. Res.-Atmos., 111(D14), https://doi.org/10.1029/2005JD006837, 2006.
- Luo, M., & Lau, N.-C.: Characteristics of summer heat stress in China during 1979–2014:
  Climatology and long-term trends, Climate Dynamics, 53(9), 5375–5388,
  https://doi.org/10.1007/s00382-019-04871-5, 2019.
- Luo, M. and Lau, N.: Increasing Human-Perceived Heat Stress Risks Exacerbated by
  Urbanization in China: A Comparative Study Based on Multiple Metrics, Earth's
  Future, 9 (7), https://doi.org/10.1029/2020EF001848, 2021.
- Lyon, B. and Barnston, A.: Diverse characteristics of US summer heat waves, J. Clim.,
  30 (19), 7827–7845, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-17-0098.1, 2017.
- Maji, K., Ye, W., Arora, M., and Nagendra, S.: PM<sub>2.5</sub>-related health and economic loss
  assessment for 338 Chinese cities, Environ. Int., 121, 392-403,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2018.09.024, 2018.
- Matthews, T., Wilby, R., and Murphy, C.: Communicating the deadly consequences of
  global warming for human heat stress, PNAS, 114, 3861-3866,
  https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1617526114, 2017.
- Miao, L., Moore, J. C., Zeng, F., Lei, J., Ding, J., He, B., and Cui, X.: Footprint of
  research in desertification management in China, Land Degrad. Dev., 26, 450-457,
  <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/ldr.2399</u>, 2015.
- Mishra, D., Goyal, P., and Upadhyay, A.: Artificial intelligence based approach to
  forecast PM<sub>2.5</sub> during haze episodes: a case study of Delhi, India, Atmos. Environ.,
  102, 239–248, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.11.050, 2015.
- Murray, F.: On the computation of saturation vapor pressure, Rand Corp Santa MonicaCalif, 1966.
- Nguyen, G., Shimadera, H., Uranishi, K., Matsuo, T., and Kondo, A.: Numerical
  assessment of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> air quality in Continental Southeast Asia: Impacts of

- future projected anthropogenic emission change and its impacts in combination with
  potential future climate change impacts, Atmos. Environ., 226, 117398,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2020.117398, 2020.
- Perkins, S. and Alexander, L.: On the measurement of heat waves, J Clim., 26 (13),
  4500–4517, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00383.1, 2013.
- Ran, Q., Lee, S., Zheng, D., Chen, H., Yang, S., Moore, J., Dong, W.: Potential Health
  and Economic Impacts of Shifting Manufacturing from China to Indonesia or India,
  Science of the total environment, 855, 158634,
  http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.158634, 2022.
- Riahi, K., Rao, S., Krey, V., Cho, C., Chirkov, V., Fischer, G., Kindermann, G.,
  Nakicenovic, N., Rafaj, P.: RCP 8.5—A scenario of comparatively high greenhouse
  gas emissions, Climatic Change 109, 33, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-011-0149y, 2011.
- Robock, A., Marquardt, A., Kravitz, B. and Stenchikov, G.: Benefits, risks, and costs of
  stratospheric geoengineering, Geophys. Res. Lett., 36(19),
  https://doi.org/10.1029/2009GL039209, 2009.
- Shepherd, J.: Geoengineering the climate: Science, governance, and uncertainty, Royal
  Society Policy document 10/09, 82 pp, 2009.
- Song, F., Zhang, G., Ramanathan, V. and Ruby Leung, L.: Trends in surface equivalent 1240 1241 potential temperature: A more comprehensive metric for global warming and 1242 weather extremes. Sci. U.S.A., 119. 6. Proc. Natl. Acad. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2117832119, 2022. 1243
- Steadman, R. G.: A universal scale of apparent temperature, J. Appl. Meteorol., 23 (12),
  1674–1687, https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0450(1984)023<1674:AUSOAT>2.
  0.CO:2, 1984.
- Steadman, R. G.: Norms of apparent temperature in Australia, Aust. Meteorol. Mag., 43,
  1–16, 1994.
- Stohl, A., Aamaas, B., Amann, M., Baker, L. H., Bellouin, N., Berntsen, T. K., Boucher, 1249 O., Cherian, R., Collins, W., Daskalakis, N., Dusinska, M., Eckhardt, S., Fuglestvedt, 1250 J. S., Harju, M., Heyes, C., Hodnebrog, Ø., Hao, J., Im, U., Kanakidou, M., Klimont, 1251 Z., Kupiainen, K., Law, K. S., Lund, M. T., Maas, R., MacIntosh, C. R., Myhre, G., 1252 Myriokefalitakis, S., Olivié, D., Quaas, J., Quennehen, B., Raut, J.-C., Rumbold, S. 1253 T., Samset, B. H., Schulz, M., Seland, Ø., Shine, K. P., Skeie, R. B., Wang, S., Yttri, 1254 1255 K. E., and Zhu, T.: Evaluating the climate and air quality impacts of short-lived pollutants, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15, 10529-10566, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-15-1256 1257 10529-2015, 2015.
- Su, J., Brauer, M., Ainslie, B., Steyn, D., Larson, T., and Buzzelli, M.: An innovative land
  use regression model incorporating meteorology for exposure analysis, Sci. Total
  Environ., 390, 520-529, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2007.10.032, 2008.
- Tong, C., Yim, S., Rothenberg, D., Wang, C., Lin, C., Chen, Y., and Lau, N.: Projecting
  the impacts of atmospheric conditions under climate change on air quality over the
  Pearl River Delta region, Atmos. Environ., 193, 79-87,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.08.053, 2018.
- 1265 Torma, C. and Giogi, F.: Assessing the contribution of different factors in regional

- 1266 climate model projections using the factor separation method, Atmos. Sci. Lett., 15,
- 1267 239–244, https://doi.org/10.1002/asl2.491, 2014.
- Upadhyay, A., Dey, S., Goyal, P., and Dash, S.: Projection of near-future anthropogenic
  PM<sub>2.5</sub> over India using statistical approach, Atmos. Environ., 186, 178-188,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.05.025, 2018.
- 1271 Vandyck, T., Keramidas, K., Saveyn, B., et al.: A global stocktake of the Paris pledges:
  1272 Implications for energy systems and economy, Global Environmental Change, 41,
  1273 46-63, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2016.08.006, 2016.
- Wang, J., Allen, D., Pickering, K., Li, Z., He, H.: Impact of aerosol direct effect on East
  Asian air quality during the EAST-AIRE campaign, J. Geophys. Res.- Atmos., 121,
  6534-6554, https://doi.org/10.1002/2016JD025108, 2016.
- Wang, J., Moore, J. C., Zhao, L., Yue, C., and Di, Z.: Regional dynamical and statistical
  downscaling temperature, humidity and windspeed for the Beijing region under
  stratospheric aerosol injection geoengineering, Earth Syst. Dynam.,
  https://doi.org/10.5194/esd-2022-35, 2022.
- Wang, J., Feng, J., Yan, Z., Hu, Y., and Jia, G.: Nested high-resolution modeling of the
  impact of urbanization on regional climate in three vast urban agglomerations in
  China, J. Geophys. Res.- Atmos., 117(D21), https://doi.org/10.1029/2012JD018226,
  2017.
- Wang, J., Zhang, L., Niu, X., and Liu, Z.: Effects of PM<sub>2.5</sub> on health and economic loss:
  Evidence from Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region of China, J. Cleaner Prod., 257, 120605,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.120605, 2020.
- Wang, P., Luo, M., Liao, W., Xu, Y., Wu, S., Tong, X., Tian, H., Xu, F., Han, Y.:
  Urbanization contribution to human perceived temperature changes in major urban
  agglomerations of China, Urban Climate, 38, 100910,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.uclim.2021.100910, 2021.
- Wang, S., Ancell, B., Huang, G., Baetz, B.: Improving robustness of hydrologic
  ensemble predictions through probabilistic pre- and post-processing in sequential
  data assimilation, Water Resources Research, 54, 2129–2151,
  https://doi.org/10.1002/2018WR022546, 2018.
- Wang, X., Huang, G., Lin, Q., Nie, X., Cheng, G., Fan, Y., Li, Z., Yao, Y., Suo, M.: A
  stepwise cluster analysis approach for downscaled climate projection a Canadian
  case study, Environ. Model Softw., 49, 141–151,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2013.08.006, 2013.
- Wang, Y., Hu, J., Zhu, J., Li, J., Qin, M., Liao, H., Chen, K., and Wang, M.: Health
  Burden and economic impacts attributed to PM<sub>2.5</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> in China from 2010 to 2050
  under different representative concentration pathway scenarios, Resour. Conserv.
  Recy., 173, 105731, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2021.105731, 2021.
- Wang, Y., Chen, L., Song, Z., Huang, Z., Ge, E., Lin, L., Luo, M.: Human-perceivedtemperature changes over South China: long-term trends and urbanization effects,
  Atmos. Res., 215, 116–127, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosres.2018.09.006, 2019.
- Wang, Y., Yao, L., Wang, L., Liu, Z., Ji, D., Tang, G., Zhang, J., Sun, Y., Hu, N., and Xin,
  J.: Mechanism for the formation of the January 2013 heavy haze pollution episode
  over central and eastern China, Sci. China Earth Sci., 57, 14-25,

- 1310 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11430-013-4773-4, 2014.
- Wang, Y., Zhuang, G., Zhang, X., Huang, K., Xu, C., Tang, A., Chen, J., and An, Z.: The
  ion chemistry, seasonal cycle, and sources of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and TSP aerosol in Shanghai,
  Atmos. Environ., 40, 2935-2952, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2005.12.051,
  2006.
- Watanabe, S., Hajima, T., Sudo, K., Nagashima, T., Takemura, T., Okajima, H., Nozawa, 1315 T., Kawase, H., Abe, M., Yokohata, T., Ise, T., Sato, H., Kato, E., Takata, K., Emori, 1316 S., and Kawamiya, M.: MIROC-ESM 2010: model description and basic results of 1317 CMIP5-20c3m experiments. Geosci. Model Dev., 4. 1318 845-872, https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-4-845-2011, 2011. 1319
- Wei, J., Li, Z., Lyapustin, A., Sun, L., Peng, Y., Xue, W., Su, T., and Cribb, M.:
  Reconstructing 1-km-resolution high-quality PM<sub>2.5</sub> data records from 2000 to 2018
  in China: spatiotemporal variations and policy implications, Remote Sens. Environ.,
  252, 112136, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2020.112136, 2021.
- Wilcke, R. A. I., Mendlik, T., Gobiet, A.: Multi-variable error correction of regional
  climate models, Clim. chang., 120(4), 871-887, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-0130845-x, 2013.
- Wu, D., Tie, X., Li, C., Ying, Z., Kai-Hon Lau, A., Huang, J., Deng, X., and Bi, X.: An
  extremely low visibility event over the Guangzhou region: a case study, Atmos.
  Environ., 39, 6568-6577, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2005.07.061, 2005.
- Wu, J., Gao, X., Giorgi, F., Chen, D.: Changes of effective temperature and cold/hot days
  in late decades over China based on a high resolution gridded observation dataset,
  Int. J. Climatol., 37:788–800, https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.5038, 2017.
- Xu, J., Yao, M., Wu, W., Qiao, X., Zhang, H., Wang, P., Yang, X., Zhao, X., and Zhang,
  J.: Estimation of ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub>-related mortality burden in China by 2030 under
  climate and population change scenarios: A modeling study, Environ, Int.,
  156,106733, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2021.106733, 2021.
- Xue, W., Zhang, J., Zhong, C., Li, X., and Wei, J.: Spatiotemporal PM<sub>2.5</sub> variations and its response to the industrial structure from 2000 to 2018 in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, J. Cleaner Prod., 279, 123742, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.123742, 2021.
- Yang, S., Ma, Y., Duan, F., He, K., Wang, L., Wei, Z., Zhu, L., Ma, T., Li, H., Ye, S.:
  Characteristics and formation of typical winter haze in Handan, one of the most
  polluted cities in China, Sci. Total Environ., 613-614, 1367-1375,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.08.033, 2018.
- Yang, X., Wu, Q., Zhao, R., Cheng, H., He, H., Ma, Q., Wang, L., and Luo, H.: New method for evaluating winter air quality: PM2.5 assessment using Community Multiscale Air Quality Modeling (CMAQ) in Xi'an, Atmos. Environ., 211, 18-28, https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2019.04.019, 2019.
- Yang, X., Zhao, C., Guo, J., and Wang, Y.: Intensification of aerosol pollution associated
  with its feedback with surface solar radiation and winds in Beijing, J. Geophys. Res.
  Atmos., 121, 4093-4099, https://doi.org/10.1002/2015JD024645, 2016.
- Yang, Y., Maraun, D., Ossó, A., and Tang, J.: Increased spatial extent and likelihood of
   compound long-duration dry and hot events in China, 1961–2014, Nat. Hazards

- 1354 Earth Syst. Sci., 23, 693–709, https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-23-693-2023, 2023.
- Yang, Y., and Tang, J.: Substantial Differences in Compound Long Duration Dry and Hot Events Over China Between Transient and Stabilized Warmer Worlds at 1.5° C
  Global Warming, Earths Future, 11, e2022EF002994, https://doi.org/10.1029/2022EF002994, 2023.
- Yang, Y., Tang, J., Xiong, Z., Wang, S., and Yuan, J.: An intercomparison of multiple statistical downscaling methods for daily precipitation and temperature over China:
  future climate projections, Clim. Dynam., 52, 6749–6771, https://doi.org/10.1007/s00382-018-4543-2, 2019.
- Yin, Z., Wang, H., and Chen, H.: Understanding severe winter haze events in the North
  China Plain in 2014: roles of climate anomalies, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 1641–
  1651, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-17-1641-2017, 2017.
- You, T., Wu, R., Huang, G., Fan, G.: Regional meteorological patterns for heavy
  pollution events in Beijing, J. Meteorolog. Res., 31, 597-611,
  https://doi.org/10.1007/s13351-017-6143-1, 2017.
- Yu, X., Moore, J. C., Cui, X., Rinke, A., Ji, D., Kravitz, B., and Yoon, J.: Impacts,
  effectiveness and regional inequalities of the GeoMIP G1 to G4 solar radiation
  management scenarios, Global and Planetary Change, 129, 10-22,
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2015.02.010, 2015.
- 1373 Zhan, P., Zhu, W., Zhang, T., Cui, X., Li, N.: Impacts of sulfate geoengineering on rice
  1374 yield in China: Results from a multimodel ensemble, Earth's Future, 7(4), 395-410,
  1375 https://doi.org/10.1029/2018EF001094, 2019.
- Zhang, Q., Zheng, Y., Tong, D., Shao, M., Wang, S., Zhang, Y., Xu, X., Wang, J., He, H.,
  Liu, W., Ding, Y., Lei, Y., Li, J., Wang, Z., Zhang, X., Wang, Y., Cheng, J., Liu, Y.,
  Shi, Q., Yan, L., Geng, G., Hong, C., Li, M., Liu, F., Zheng, B., Cao, J., Ding, A.,
  Gao, J., Fu, Q., Huo, J., Liu, B., Liu, Z., Yang, F., He, K., and Hao, J.: Drivers of
  improved PM<sub>2.5</sub> air quality in China from 2013 to 2017, PNAS, 116, 24463-24469,
  https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1907956116, 2019.
- Zhang, Z., Gong, D., Mao, R., Kim, S., Xu, J., Zhao, X., and Ma, Z.: Cause and predictability for the severe haze pollution in downtown Beijing in November–
  December 2015, Sci. Total Enviro., 592, 627-638, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.03.009, 2017.
- Zhao, D., Xin, J., Gong, C., Quan, J., Liu, G., Zhao, W., Wang, Y., Liu, Z., and Song, T.: 1386 1387 The formation mechanism of air pollution episodes in Beijing city: insights into the measured feedback between aerosol radiative forcing and the atmospheric boundary 1388 layer stability, Sci. Total Environ., 692, 371-381, 1389 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.07.255, 2019. 1390
- Zheng, C., Zhao, C., Zhu, Y., Wang, Y., Shi, X., Wu, X., Chen, T., Wu, F., and Qiu, Y.:
  Analysis of influential factors for the relationship between PM<sub>2.5</sub> and AOD in
  Beijing, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 13473–13489, https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-171394
- Zhou, B., Xu, Y., Wu, J., Dong, S., and Shi, Y.: Changes in temperature and precipitation
  extreme indices over China: analysis of a high-resolution grid dataset, Int. J.
  Climatol., 36, 1051–1066, https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.4400, 2016.

Zhu, J., Wang, S., Huang, G.: Assessing Climate Change Impacts on Human-Perceived
Temperature Extremes and Underlying Uncertainties, Journal of Geophysical
Research: Atmosphere, 124 (7), 3800-3821, https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JD029444,
2019.

Zhu, X., Huang, G., Zhou, X., Zheng, S.: Projection of apparent temperature using
statistical downscaling approach in the Pearl River Delta, Theor. Appl. Climatol.,
1404 144 (3–4), 1253–1266, https://doi.org/10.1007/s00704-021-03603-2, 2021.